



# HUMAN SECURITY VS NATIONAL SECURITY

*Natalya Belitser*  
*Pylyp Orlyk Institute for Democracy*

**Round table “HUMAN SECURITY AND SECURITY SECTOR REFORM  
IN EASTERN EUROPE”**

**Kyiv, 8 June 2017**

# Human Security: DEFINITION

*“...Human focuses on the safety of individuals and communities. At minimum, human security refers to safety from direct threats of violence. A comprehensive approach to human security includes three components:*

- freedom from fear
- freedom from want, and
- freedom to live in dignity”

The very notion of human security is rather new and yet poorly comprehensible for both governments and populations of the post-Soviet countries where for a long time, state security has been considered “above all”.

Are those two notions contradict or complement each other? – in a number of critical situations – in particular, facing terrorism – there are grave threats to both.

# TERRORISM: Global Spreading

Terrorism presents grave threats to both human (individuals) and national (states) security

”Old” and ”new” terrorism: trends and differences

- ”Old”: clear-cut aims & demands
- ”New”: overwhelming revenge? ”All-out war” on the West? Political destabilisation, especially ahead of elections? (At the expense of obvious raising anti-Islam, anti-Muslim passions throughout the world?)

Who/what is behind, in particular, the ISIS?

# National and international responses: Lessons for Ukraine

## UK: three terrorist attacks in a few recent months

### Responses:

- “LONDON ISN'T BURNING: HOW BRITAIN'S HISTORY WITH THE IRA MADE IT RESILIENT IN THE FACE OF ATTACK” (3 MARCH 2017). “The IRA was something that we understood... ISIS has little if anything in the way of legitimate political aims behind it”.
- “AFTER ANOTHER TERRORIST ATTACK, LONDON KEEPS CALM AND CARRIES ON”; “STAND UP, STAY STRONG AND TELL THE KILLERS THEY WILL NEVER WIN”; “BRITAIN REACTS TO THE LONDON ATTACK AS IT KNOWS BEST—WITH SARCASM”; (4 MAY 2017).
- **BUT:** “Enough is enough” - Prime Minister Theresa May vowed a new battle against Islamic extremists. She also said that human rights laws could be changed for terror fight.

# Responses (continued)

- **France:** state of emergency (introduced in 2015) prolonged. How effective are the measures taken?
- **Middle East/Gulf states:**
- On **June 5**, in unexpected sudden move, seven countries - including Saudi Arabia, Egypt, the United Arab Emirates and Bahrain - severed their ties with Qatar accusing it of supporting terrorism. This is an unprecedented breach between the most powerful members of the Gulf Cooperation Council.
- US Secretary of State Rex Tillerson called on five Arab nations to work out their differences, following their leaders' decision on **Qatar - the key U.S. ally** - over its alleged support for regional terrorist groups, specifically the Muslim Brotherhood, and Iran.
- **June 7:** U.S. investigators believe **Russian hackers breached Qatar's state news agency and planted a fake news report that contributed to a crisis among Washington's Gulf allies.**

# Ukraine: human security & human rights on the occupied territories

## BASIC FACTS:

- By law adopted by the VR in October 2014, Crimea is officially recognised as a part of Ukraine's territory **temporarily occupied on 20 February 2014 by the Russian Federation**
- By the end of summer the same year, Ukraine has lost control over some regions of eastern Donbas as a result of the aggression of local separatists with active involvement of military forces and armed 'volunteers' from the RF
- In such a way, these territories have also become **de facto occupied.**
- **Situation with human rights and human security on the occupied territories is horrible and constantly deteriorating.** There are confirmed cases of **summary executions, 'disappearances' (abductions), arbitrary detentions, numerous searches etc.**
- One of the major threats to many of detainees is a **widespread practice of tortures** by 'investigators' aiming to force the victims to 'recognise' the crimes committed.

# Crimea's specifics

- In contrast to lawlessness on the occupied territories of Donbas where lootings, beatings and other crimes are realities of everyday life, one can expect that in the annexed Crimea, at least legislation of the RF could have been observed
- But this is not the case. **Human rights situation in Crimea is worse than in other regions of Russia;** abundant violations of both international and domestic legal norms and standards result in growing **human insecurity**
- There are systematic attempts to suppress the voices and/or activities of any person or group manifesting – or just being suspected of – **disagreement with the fact of occupation.** **The main targets and victims of such a policy are indigenous Crimean Tatar people and ethnic Ukrainians.**

# Crimean Tatars

- Systemic discrimination, persecutions and repressions targeting Crimean Tatars aim at their intimidation and forcing them to leave the peninsula which is their only homeland.
- As a result of occupation and according to the most cautious estimations, there are at least 24 political prisoners, 16 'disappeared' and 10 persons killed. Among them, number of Crimean Tatars is: 18 out of 24, 10 out of 16, and 7 out of 10. (Proportion of Crimean Tatars within the whole population of Crimea is about 14 – 15%).
- The ban, in the fall of 2016, of the Mejlis - the main representative organ of the Crimean Tatar indigenous people – as an 'extremist organization' is an **unprecedented case of banning not just an 'organisation' or 'association' but the body elected by the whole indigenous people.**

# Persecutions of Crimean Muslims

- There are already **19 men, almost all Crimean Tatars**, in custody on the charges of either ‘organising’ or ‘involvement’ in pan-Islamic organisation **Hizb ut-Tahrir**. Four of them were transferred for a trial to the Russian city Rostov
- **There is not a single evidence that the organization itself is ‘terrorist’, nor that the men are in fact members of it**
- However, on September 7, 2016 the court sentenced them for long-term imprisonment
- Moscow HRC “Memorial” designated them as **‘political prisoners’**
- **Notorious Soviet-time practice of ‘punitive psychiatry’ is also used against Crimean Tatars.**

# What can be done

- Facing actual deadlock and inability of international community to restore the post-WWII world order, Ukraine might try to **strengthen human security regime** on the occupied territories by using more effectively the existing instruments of international humanitarian law.
- The most important of them is the **4<sup>th</sup> Geneva Convention of 1949 – the treaty ratified by both Ukraine and Russia**
- Geneva Conventions created **the main basis of the international humanitarian law** and as such - in contrast to other treaties - **could not be revised** according to the established procedure.
- Therefore, for the RF to find legitimate ways of repudiation them would be much more difficult task than refusing to abide the decisions of the International Criminal Court or the ECHR.

# Continued

- To improve HR and HS situation on the occupied territories, Ukraine could (should?) initiate the formation of the system of **Protecting Powers** foreseen by the 4<sup>th</sup> Geneva Convention.
- This particular opportunity is also important in view of the unfulfilled pledges of the states – **signatories of the Budapest Memorandum**. Having at least political responsibility with regard to Russia's military aggression against Ukraine, both **the US and the UK** might perceive favourably such a request.
- Two other countries – **France and China**, members of the NPT as the states possessing nuclear arsenals, supported the Assurances although did not put their signatures.
- These states could also be invited to join a club; **the RF, on its side, could be proposed to nominate its own candidates to serve as the Protecting Powers.**

# Human security in the 'Mainland' Ukraine

- A major challenge: reformation of law-enforcement and security systems needs not only structural and technical renovation but also conceptual changes in aims and approaches
- First steps in reformation of patrolling police are considered as 'moderate success' but much more work is still ahead...
- Ever increasing activity of civil society and its enhanced role in reformation of security sector might be a cornerstone of further achievements.

# 'Risk Groups' and categories

- Traditionally vulnerable group is members of [Roma ethnic minority](#) who often suffer from discrimination and sometimes acts of violence perpetrated by local gangs and ordinary residents
- [Refugees and asylum seekers](#) (especially from Russia and other authoritarian post-Soviet states)
- Problems are usually caused by the **unreformed Migration Service of Ukraine and courts**
- **Recent case of Ildar Valiev:** a Kazan Tatar was detained in Odesa because of Russia's demand of extradition **on charges of 'involvement' with Hizb ut-Tahrir** and put him on INTERPOL 'Wanted' list. It raises question about **a dubious role of INTERPOL** itself (*for more details, see: **Why would INTERPOL & Ukraine help Russia seize another political prisoner?***)

07.06.2017, by Halya Coynash <http://khpg.org/en/index.php?id=1496783044>)

# Human security and social networks

- **New risk groups appeared among teenagers** - active participants of popular Internet social networks, in particular, **Vkontakte**.
- The threat relates to the so-called '**suicide groups**' whose users, following a set of commands and instructions from their administrators, are led gradually to suicidal acts often eventuated by fatal casualties.
- In Ukraine, over the last few months the cyber-police unit has blocked **more than 500 'groups of death'** in Internet, and **arrested over 200 accounts** of their organisers and 'curators'.
- This might serve as a serious argument in the heated debates between supporters and opponents of banning Russian social networks in Ukraine (**Human Rights vs Human Security**).

# VIPs, public figures, important witnesses

- A few cases of protecting them successfully are known to wide public; one of them is **Ilia Bogdanov** – former FSB officer who arrived in Ukraine coming from Russia in summer of 2014, took part in ATO operation, received Ukrainian citizenship and was kidnapped in November 2016. He was liberated at the Ukrainian-Russian border in a course of special operation worked out by the SBU.
- Resonance murders of the prominent journalist **Pavel Sheremet** (20 July 2016) and **Denis Voronenkov** (March 23 2017) revealed **serious gaps and drawbacks in the whole system aimed at ensuring the safety of persons belonging to this category.**

# Recent terrorist attack in Kyiv

- The terrorist attack on [Adam Osmayev](#) and his wife [Amina Okuyeva](#) – volunteers, fighting on the Ukrainian side in the Chechen battalion by Djohar Dudayev - was made on June 1, 2017.
- This is the only case when the killer came under fire in response. He was wounded and detained on the crime spot; on-going investigation reveals his criminal background and Russian ties.
- [Amina Okuyeva \(see the next slide\) fired from the gun awarded by Arsen Avakov, Minister of Interior of Ukraine. This accident invigorated, \*inter alia\*, public debates on the right for possessing small arms by 'responsible citizens' \(thus contributing to human security?\).](#)

