

# REPORT ON FINDINGS OF MASS MEDIA MONITORING IN ARMENIA

Monitoring has been done by the team of the Analytical Centre on Globalization and Regional Cooperation (ACGRC), Yerevan, Republic of Armenia

[www.acgrc.am](http://www.acgrc.am)

## CONTENT

|  |    |
|--|----|
| I. INTRODUCTION.....   | 2  |
| II. TERMINOLOGY AND ABBREVIATIONS USED .....                   | 3  |
| III. MONITORING METHODOLOGY .....                              | 4  |
| IV. MONITORING OF TV PROGRAMS.....                             | 5  |
| 4.1. “Time will show” .....                                    | 5  |
| 4.2. “60 minutes” .....  | 13 |
| 4.3. “Evening with Vladimir Solovyov” .....                    | 22 |
| 4.4. “Countdown” .....   | 29 |
| V. SPECIAL OVERVIEW .....                                      | 33 |
| VI. ARMENIAN PRINTED AND ELECTRONIC MASS MEDIA MONITORING..... | 37 |
| 6.2. “Hraparak” daily .....                                    | 38 |
| 6.4. “Iravunq” daily.....                                      | 40 |
| 6.5. “Irates” daily .....                                      | 42 |
| 6.6. www.vesti.am .....  | 43 |
| 6.7. www.nt.am .....   | 44 |
| 6.8. www.armeniasputnik.am .....                               | 45 |
| 6.9. www.tert.am .....   | 46 |
| 6.10. www.regnum.ru.....                                       | 47 |

## I. INTRODUCTION

“Analytical Center for Globalization and Regional Cooperation” non-governmental organization, during October-December 2017 within scope of Measuring the public's views regarding International organizations and Monitoring of Media in Armenia on Disinformation and 'Fake News' project has been conducting monitoring of selected Russian and Armenian mass-medias and electronic media aiming to identify whether directed information is or propaganda is used, what kind of possible qualifications are available for the wider audience of Russian and Armenian news and media sites. Also, the monitoring considered the possible impact of the Russian mass media on the Armenian media.

At the initial stage of the project, a number of television news channels have been monitored to target the main sources of information that can be classified as propaganda. As a result, the main news outlets broadcast on the TV channels below were considered.

- ✓ Public Television of Armenia (First Channel)
- ✓ Armenian Second TV Channel 2
- ✓ Center, Armenian TV Company
- ✓ AR, Armenian TV Company
- ✓ Shant, Armenian TV Company
- ✓ Yerkir Media, Armenian TV Company
- ✓ Ararat, Armenian TV Company
- ✓ The first Russian channel
- ✓ Russian 1 channel

The review of these sources revealed that almost all programs broadcasted are used in labeling and referral information, but there are several programs with the most prominent propaganda and labeling information available on Ararat TV, Russia 1 Channel and the First Russian Channel. Consequently, a decision has been made to conduct continues monitoring of the aired programs on the outlined above channels.

## II. TERMINOLOGY AND ABBREVIATIONS USED

| N   | TERMINOLOGY,<br>ABBREVIATION | EXPLANATION  |
|-----|------------------------------|--|
| 1.  | Monitoring, oversee          | Monitoring on oversight of certain conditions or the condition of the situation for the assessment of the quality  |
| 2.  | MM                           | Mass Media   |
| 3.  | Directed Information         | As a rule, one-sided, incomplete, sometimes non-true information spread among the public aiming to shape public behavior or attitude   |
| 4.  | EU                           | European Union   |
| 5.  | EEU                          | Eurasian Economic Union  |
| 6.  | Propaganda                   | Propaganda, which is understood in a modern political discourse as the dissemination of views, facts, arguments, and other information, including intentional distortion and misleading public opinion or attitude |
| 7.  | NATO                         | North Atlantic Treaty Organization   |
| 8.  | UN                           | United Nations   |
| 9.  | PACE                         | Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe  |
| 10. | GPS                          | Global Positioning System (location-based system)  |
| 11. | RF                           | Russian Federation   |
| 12. | d.l.s.                       | Candidate of legal science   |
| 13. | LDPR (ЛДПР)                  | Liberal Democratic Party of Russia   |
| 14. | Fake news                    | False Information  |
| 15. | DNR and LNR                  | Donetsk and Luhansk self-declared “National republics”   |
| 16. | RP                           | Road police  |
| 17. | NGO                          | Non-governmental organization  |
| 18. | RA NA                        | National Assembly of the Republic of Armenia   |
| 19. | IS                           | Islamic state  |
| 20. | RPA                          | Republican Party of Armenia  |
| 21. | PS                           | Patrol Service   |
| 22. | LGBT                         | Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual and Transgender   |

### III. MONITORING METHODOLOGY

From October to December 2017, three Russian and one Armenian TV programs have been monitored.

| Name in English                  | Name in Russian               | Broadcasting TV station | Daily duration     | Number of broadcast per week | Totally     |
|----------------------------------|-------------------------------|-------------------------|--------------------|------------------------------|-------------|
| “Time will show”                 | Время покажет                 | Russian first channel   | 2hours 45 minutes  | 5 times                      | 23 programs |
| «60 minutes»                     | 60 минут                      | Russia 1 channel        | 1 hours 30 minutes | 5 times                      | 45 programs |
| «Evening with Vladimir Solovyov» | Вечер с Владимиром Соловьевым | Russia 1 channel        | 3 hours            | 5 times                      | 19 programs |
| Countdown                        |                               | Ararat TV               | 30 minutes         | 5 times                      | 23 programs |

The purpose of this monitoring was to examine how the propaganda is carried out on Russian TV and how much it is reflected on Armenian air. It was noteworthy to consider what topics and issues are in the center of disseminated propaganda and directed information and in what terminology they are provided to the public.

To this end, questionnaires and work guidelines were developed, according to which the monitoring team each member should conduct the day-to-day monitoring of each broadcast, write out the topic of the program, the names and positions of guests, as well as the phrases and terms used by them as labeling during programs.

Later, the reviewer analyzed how many times the same topic was covered in the same program, how many times the same guest participated in various broadcasts of the same programs, which are frequently repeated expressions and opinions that are provided to the audience and enthalpy, the main points that might be considered as a main propaganda adopted within frames of the present program are summarized.

Due to the necessity parallels were drawn between the propaganda carried out by the Armenian and Russian mass media, to show how topics discussed and desalinated on Russian media broadcast are reflected in the Armenian media field.

From 15<sup>th</sup> of September up to 15<sup>th</sup> of December, 2017 5 printed (“Aravot,” “Hraparak,” “Hayoc Ashxarh” dailies, “Irates” published once per two days and “Iravunq” published once per three

days) and 5 online media ([www.regnum.ru](http://www.regnum.ru), [www.vesti.am](http://www.vesti.am), [www.armeniasputnik.am](http://www.armeniasputnik.am), [www.nt.am](http://www.nt.am), [www.tert.am](http://www.tert.am)) available in Armenia have been monitored.

The observer read these sources of information in daily routine, summarized the main topics under discussion and, if necessary, wrote down separate expressions.

Five topics have been selected as a subject of monitoring: coverage of NGOs, materials on the West, materials on European values, materials on the Ukrainian and Syrian crisis. Monitoring was carried out in three dimensions: Analysis of selected topics, interviews, and reflections of events - news.

#### IV. MONITORING OF TV PROGRAMS

Here are the following analyzes of monitored TV programs:

##### *4.1. "Time will show"*

*The program has clear anti-Western rhetoric. Very often, posing questions to pro-western experts the programmers use sarcasm, dishonest expressions, showing that the experts have wrong opinion and understanding of the world. Two of the programmers (Artyom Shani and Anatoly Kuzicev) have been emphasizing negatively about Western countries, and the third, Yekaterina Strazhenova, comes from a naive and peaceful hostess, often questioning naive or elementary questions by emphasizing their message and rhetoric.*

*About 70 percent of the guests are always anti-West and pro-Russian rhetoric experts, and 30 percent, on the contrary. During broadcasts, efforts are made to humiliate, offend, or make gestures to the latter and to the states they represent. The male programmers have a huge amount of information and a very good analytical database due to which they respond or appose to any question/opinion.*

During the targeted period, a total of 23 broadcasts have been monitored, the main topics of which are outlined below:

1. **Broadcasting** 21.11.2017

*Topic:* The main part of the program was dedicated to the 4th anniversary of Ukrainian Maydan events.

2. **Broadcasting** 22.11.2017

*Topic:* Ukrainian Maydan events. Relations between Russia and the West.

3. **Broadcasting** 23.11.2017  
*Topic:* The program was largely devoted to the situation in Ukraine. Russia's victory in Syria.
4. **Broadcasting** 24.11.2017  
*Topic:* The situation in Ukraine. Russia's withdrawal from PACE. Russia and the West.
5. **Broadcasting** 27.11.2017  
*Topic:* Mainly about entrance and of the Ukrainian forces on the territory of the “Democratic Republic of Donetsk” and liberating some villages.
6. **Broadcasting** 28.11.2017  
*Topic:* Depriving Russian athletes of Olympic medals. Russia's possible steps on this issue.
7. **Broadcasting** 29.11.2017  
*Topic:* North Korea's missile launch, dismantling of Russian athletes at the Olympics, and internal situation in Ukraine.
8. **Broadcasting** 30.11.2017  
*Topic:* Disqualification of Russian athletes for doping, frightening Shakhtar football team players by nationalists (generally speaking against this phenomenon, accusing Ukrainian nationalists). One hour of the program was devoted to the issue of expanding the Russian family, presenting domestic problems and discussing the possibilities for their solution.
9. **Broadcasting** 01.12.2017  
*Topic:* In the first part, the letter from Ukrainian spiritual leader Filaret to Russian spiritual leaders calling for the unity was discussed. It was mainly presented as a show that aims to increase the power of the Filaret.  
The other part of the program was dedicated to topic of Trump being a "Russian agent", estimating with sarcasm that it is not possible.  
The third part of the program was devoted to the disqualification of Russian athletes, representing that it is a policy against Russia.
10. **Broadcasting** 04.12.2017  
*Topic:* The first part was dedicated to the disqualification of Russian athletes by the International Olympic Committee. The second topic was the US domestic situation.
11. **Broadcasting** 05.12.2017  
*Topic:* Attempt to arrest Saakashvili in Ukraine, disqualification of the Russian team at the Olympics.
12. **Broadcasting** 06.12.2017  
*Topic:* Participation of Russian national team in Olympic Games. Attempt to arrest Saakashvili in Ukraine. Putin's nomination in presidential elections.
13. **Broadcasting** 07.12.2017

*Topic:* Tramp's statement on recognizing Jerusalem as the capital city. Elections in Russia. Olympic Games. The situation in Ukraine.

14. **Broadcasting** 08.12.2017

*Topic:* Jerusalem's status: The situation in Ukraine.

15. **Broadcasting** 11.12.2017

*Topic:* Liberation of Syria, Ukraine situation. A separate part was dedicated to Ksenia Sobchak's pre-elections campaign.

16. **Broadcasting** 12.12.2017

*Topic:* Saakashvili's release. The issue of participating in or not participating in the Olympic Games (discussing general situation regarding sport in the country).

17. **Broadcasting** 13.12.2017

*Topic:* Corruption in Russia. Presidential candidate Boris Titov as guest. Situation in Ukraine. The Mission of Women's Rights Protection by NATO Forces.

18. **Broadcasting** 14.12.2017

*Topic:* discussion on who what kind of questions would ask Putin during his press conference. Discussion on domestic issues. In the second part, Putin's answers were discussed, mainly about the domestic economic situation.

19. **Broadcasting** 15.12.2017

*Topic:* Situation before the presidential election. Alexei Ulyukaev's arrest. Sanctions imposed on Russia. The situation in Donbas.

20. **Broadcasting** 18.12.2017

*Topic:* Some changes in the traffic police. The issue of participation or non-participation in the Olympic Games. Situation in Ukraine. Resumption of World War III.

21. **Broadcasting** 19.12.2017

*Topic:* Discussions about the GPS device purchased through the Internet. Relations between Russia and the West. Relations with the United States. Future with Putin.

22. **Broadcasting** 20.12.2017

*Topic:* Domestic Violence in Russia. Ukraine as a US program. The situation in Donbas. The meaning of the UN.

23. **Broadcasting** 21.12.2017

*Topic:* Tax system changes. The strong leaders of Russia's history and their policies. Strain the situation in Donbas.

In 18 out of 23 broadcasts monitored (in the main part of the broadcast, in some part of it or in whole), there were discussions on Ukraine, inter alia, on Maidan, Saakashvili and Donbas.

10 broadcasts were dedicated to the issues regarding the disqualification of Russian athletes and the restriction of their participation in the Olympics were discussed and looked upon as an anti-Russian policy.

Monitored 7 broadcasts were dedicated to the West, Trump and certain western organizations.

The political issues of Russia, in particular the upcoming presidential elections, and mainly Putin's involvement and role were touched upon in 7 out of all monitored broadcasts.

The domestic problems of the country were touched upon only in 3 programs that concerned the expansion of the Russian family, the corruption in the country, as well as the changes in the tax system and the strong leaders of Russia and their policies.

It was particularly interesting to observe the guests of the talk show who acted as the main disseminators of propaganda. The analysis has shown that the same guest-experts are usually invited to several broadcasts of the same program as the same and different themes. The main thing is that the guests of the program are quite famous people such as Vladimir Zhirinovskiy, RF State Duma deputies Yuri Afonin, Alexei Zhuravlev, Svetlana Savchenko, First Deputy Chairman of the Russian Federation Defense and Security Committee Franz Klindovic, deputies of Ukrainian 5-7 convocation Higher Rada members Spiridon Kilyinkov, Elena Bondarenko.

Here, naturally, the terminology and vocabulary used by the former Higher Rada members, especially the latter, spoke of Ukraine's dependence on the United States and control of the USA over Ukraine, limitation of political rights and the spread of fear.

Thus, the list of the most frequently invited, guests who use the most extreme vocabulary and statements within this TV program are presented below.

- ✚ Maxim Shevchenko, a member of the Civil Society and Human Rights Development Council (attached to the Russian President), is a journalist who has taken part in 13 broadcasts out of totally 23 ones talking about the Armenians, Ukraine, Saakashvili, the United States, NATO and the West.
- ✚ Michael Delyagin, Director of the Globalization Studies Institute, who has taken part in 7 broadcasts out of totally 23 ones speaking about the disqualification of Ukraine, the United States and Russian athletes.
- ✚ Evgeny Tarlo, political scientist, president of the "Legal State" fund, who has participated in 6 broadcasts as a guest and spoke about the sanctions against Ukraine, US and Russia, as well as Russia's domestic problems.
- ✚ Alexander Kluckin, a political scientist, who has taken part in 3 shows as a guest, speaks mainly of the United States.

- ✚ Nikolai Topornny, Associate Professor of the Department of European Law, MD, Moscow State Institute of International Relations (MGIMO), participated in 3 programs speaking mainly on Ukraine and the United States.
- ✚ Sargis Tsaturyan, Regnum's correspondent, candidate of historical sciences, participated in 3 broadcasts on mainly Ukraine and the United States.
- ✚ Karine Gevorgyan, a political scientist, participated in 2 airtime talks mainly on Ukraine and the United States.
- ✚ Gevorg Mirzayan, Associate Professor of Political Science at the Financial University under the Government of the Russian Federation, a correspondent for "Expert" magazine, participated in 2 broadcasts speaking mainly on Ukraine and the United States.

It is noteworthy that the invited guests on different broadcasts, often talking about different topics, used clear and repetitive specific **expressions and terminology**. For example, talking about *Ukrainian theme* the main emphasis and flow of information was directed serve the audience with the following thoughts and terms:

- ✚ Ukraine, which today goes through the Nazi path, will end up in the same way as the Fascist Germany.
- ✚ Most Ukrainians run away to Russia and not to Europe, as civilization in Ukraine is based on hatred, there is no any positive idea there.
- ✚ Maidan was not for Eurointegration, they deceived the Ukrainians and drove them out.
- ✚ Maidan was mainly organized by Germany, which was interested in its dominant power in Eastern Europe, but those who headed it were mostly located beyond the ocean (*meaning the United States*).
- ✚ Germans want to weaken Russia through Ukraine.
- ✚ We (*meaning Russians*) stand on both our feet on our land, cursing the conspiracy of the American imperialists in provoking the Ukrainian war.
- ✚ In Ukraine, they had a goal: to separate Ukraine from Russia so that we would not sign the Treaty of Eurasian Economic Union.
- ✚ Parades with using nationalistic symbolic is prohibited in European normal countries, but they occur in Ukraine. Here comes the term Ukrainian fascism.
- ✚ There is our Ukrainian (*Russian*) segment and the other part which is temporarily occupied by obscene nationalist separatists.
- ✚ There are two Ukraines: One is an anti-Russian, who receives money from Russia's enemies, and another Ukraine that fights for its independence (*Donbas, Luhansk ...*).
- ✚ Of course, it would be strange if Russia did not respond to America's harsh interference in Ukraine's internal affairs.

- ✚ The current Ukrainian authorities, who came to power illegally, do not see people, they only see the territory.
- ✚ Europe's goal is to dictate conditions to Russia.
- ✚ It is necessary to take all possible measures for closing all the ways in which the Russian elite finances Ukrainian nationalists. All these people should be memorized.
- ✚ Kurt Volker (*US Special Representative in Ukraine*) is an enemy.
- ✚ Since Ukraine has partially become part of the US colony, the US is interested in switching to military economy. In such a large area, the United States is interested in the war and our inclusion in it (*Russia*). That's what they play. This is advantageous for the military industry.
- ✚ Removal from Russian culture is a decline for Ukrainians. There is no any famous Ukrainian composer, writer in the world.
- ✚ Ukraine has lost its pride. There is terrorism. They are nationalists. That has become their pride. They live in terrorism.
- ✚ The Ukrainians showed that they do not have either a prosecutor's office, a security service, a government or a state ...
- ✚ The decision-making center in Kyiv is located in the US Embassy.
- ✚ The EU Eastern Partnership is about how to prevent consolidation around Moscow.
- ✚ There is a civil war in Ukraine, there are no Russian troops there.

Particularly, talking about *Saakashvili* the main accents were as follows:

- ✚ Saakashvili also begins talking about war, and will soon attack us (*Russia*) ... The golden boy in America focuses on Ukraine's military rather than social issues.
- ✚ Both are bad, Saakashvili and Poroshenko, but now they push Ukraine for war, not in Donbas, but with Russia ... first through Donbas, and then how it will go. This is the dream of our "esteemed" American partners.
- ✚ Saakashvili's arrest was for raising his rating.
- ✚ Saakashvili's success is that he filled Georgia with agents from the Central Intelligence Agency (CIA), making Georgia a NATO servant, making it a platform for possible war with Russia. ... the same assignment is in Ukraine.
- ✚ Poroshenko also maneuvered, he also has a amount of freedom. Any regional leader is not fully exposed to Washington. That is why Saakashvili was necessary.
- ✚ Saakashvili is a tool in the US neoconservative elite. The goal is to create instability on the Russian border. Saakashvili was necessary for destabilization of Georgian political situation, and to prevent reconciliation of Russia and Iran. This is a weapon of war against Russia, this is the weapon of hybrid war, he is not a clown.

- ✚ All the performances of Saakashvili are another trick for making money.
- ✚ We (*Russians*) consider Saakashvili to be a US swindler.

Discussions on the ban on participation of the *Russian national team in the Olympic Games* was mainly based on the following rhetoric:

- ✚ US athletes have been "caught" three times more this year for doping. This is pure politics.
- ✚ Sport has become a politics.
- ✚ The Western forces want to break the spirit of Russian athletes before the Olympics.
- ✚ American athletes (including Williams sisters) use stimulants, however nobody "discloses" that because they are Americans.
- ✚ We (*Russia*) should stop carrying out our duties at the World Trade Organization for the protection of our athletes.
- ✚ This is not a sport, it's a dirty policy, dirty politics.

The viewpoints of the *West and the United States* mostly have the following shades:

- ✚ NATO provokes all these conflicts, this whole chaos ... Who is the main aggressor for NATO today? Of course, Russia. The Russians will come and you will be frustrated, and this fear is very well sold in European countries (*About NATO Women's Rights Protection Mission*).
- ✚ Formally the United States is considered to be the winner of the Islamist state, they have taken two capitals, Mosul and Rakhtan. It does not matter how many Russian and Syrian soldiers have been killed there.
- ✚ Europe's territory is under US occupation and as long as US troops are in their territory, Europe can not implement its own policy.
- ✚ The main goal of the US was establishment of the NATO base in Crimea, which failed.
- ✚ Everything America makes is directed towards one thing: change of ruling power inside Russia.
- ✚ The West had a crisis of identity after the collapse of the USSR, it did not find its identity for almost a quarter of a century and finally found hatred towards us (*Russia*).
- ✚ Their (*about western countries*) religion (democracy), has died, and now their religion is Russian-phobia. They have no other feelings but only fear.
- ✚ US sells weapons to Ukraine.
- ✚ Americans are the organizers of all wars in the planet.
- ✚ America fills Ukraine with money, but not for making it a rich country, but for a long-lasting conflict, and that Russia will be involved in that frightening plan.

- ✚ The war will end up when American bases disappear from our continent, occupying Eurasia. At that time, there would be peace in Eurasia and Americans would be kicked-out of there.
- ✚ The US looks at terrorism with one eye, seeing only one side of it, and considering the other part normal.
- ✚ The US does not need negotiations. The US needs a position:
- ✚ Today fascism is a tool of the West against Russia.
- ✚ 65% of Americans are stupid.
- ✚ Unlike the US, there is freedom of speech in our country (*Russia*).
- ✚ US military trainings are being conducted against China and Russia.
- ✚ The West creates and supports non-governmental organizations and using them interferes into domestic affairs of Russia. The funding of NGOs by the US continues to grow.
- ✚ US hampers dialogue between North and South Korea.
- ✚ The Western coalition, led by the US, pretends to fight against terrorists. This way, they have weakened military action against the Islamic State.

*Thus, resuming the series of these broadcasts, it can be definitely concluded that, by successively streamed broadcasts, the talk show seeks to communicate the following ideas to its audience:*

- 1. There are two Ukraines. One is Russian which is good and the other is Fascist, Nazi.*
- 2. The movements in Ukraine are not the result of domestic demand, it is provoked by the US, Germany and Europe.*
- 3. Ukraine is nothing without Russia.*
- 4. There is no democracy in Ukraine, human rights are not guaranteed, there is terrorism there.*
- 5. Mikheil Saakashvili is a US mercenary, who, according to the US plan, has destabilized the situation in Georgia and is now tries to do the same in Ukraine, receiving for that mission certain reward.*
- 6. The US is an aggressor who simply pursues a policy of aggression, and Russia is that powerful state which should fight this evil.*
- 7. Disqualification of Russian athletes and the ban on their participation in the Olympic Games were exclusively sanctioned against Russia.*

### *Reflection on Armenia*

On November 24, 2017, the Republic of Armenia and the European Union signed an Armenia-EU Comprehensive and Enhanced Partnership Agreement in Brussels, and on this occasion special

attention was paid to the extent to which that event was covered by monitored broadcasts. For example, within the framework of this particular TV program, aired on 24.11.2017, broadcast programmer host Catherine Stratenova expressed an opinion that Belarus, Moldova, Ukraine, Azerbaijan, Georgia and Armenia are former USSR countries and today they call themselves Russia's enemies.

The theme was also developed by the program guests, who particularly expressed the following views:

✚ **Maxim Shevchenko, member of the Civil Society and Human Rights Council (attached to RF President), journalist**

The part of Armenians who are Russia's supporters are our supporters, and the other part that support you (*meaning Europe*) is our enemies.

And Karabakh is a part of Azerbaijan (*in response to a question*) and this issue should be settled by a trilateral agreement between Moscow, Ankara and Tehran.

✚ **Anatoly Kuzicev, programmer**

A war was declared to us (*by Europe*). They say we are enemies and want to fight. Russia is an enemy: This is a consensus. If Armenia wants to have good relations both with the United States and Russia, how is it possible if both sides are opposite states, it does not contradict? Two years ago, Armenia was an electric maiden. They did not know how much they pay for 1 kilowatt, and I suppose they were "slightly" pushed to get out of the demonstrations.

✚ **Sergey Kurginyan, political scientist, leader of the "The essence of time" movement**

Does Armenia want to live? Yes, it wants. It means that it will not go beyond the Russian policy format. Western forces can always make the minority to go to the streets to but the decisions should be made by the majority through democratic elections. This majority has the genetic memory of what benefits they have received from Russia.

✚ **Sergei Strokan, correspondent of the Kommersant newspaper**

Let someone tell you what kind of profit those states (*Eastern Partnership*) have received from Europe. It is just a "mule".

## 4.2. "60 minutes"

*The talk show has a pro-Russian orientation. Its rhetoric is not strongly anti-western as it is in the "Time will show" program. Though, by their facial expressions and gestures, the hosts often demonstrate contempt towards the views expressed by pro-western experts.*

The talk show is released daily, with day- and night-time broadcasts. During the targeted period, a total of 45 broadcasts have been monitored, the main topics of which are outlined below:

✚ **Broadcasting 21.11.17**

1. Day-time broadcast: Ukraine, Dignity and Freedom Day
2. Night-time broadcast: Developments in the Ukrainian Maidan
- ✚ **Broadcasting 22.11.17**
  3. Day-time broadcast: Sanctions imposed on Russia
  4. Night-time broadcast: Victory of Russian troops in Syria
- ✚ **Broadcasting 23.11.17**
  5. Day-time broadcast: Crimea
  6. Night-time broadcast: Supply of weapon to Ukraine by America
- ✚ **Broadcasting 24.11.17**
  7. Day-time broadcast: International relations
  8. Night-time broadcast: Is Russia preparing for war? (the latest developments, numbers)
- ✚ **Broadcasting 27.11.17**
  9. Day-time broadcast: Ukraine has violated the Minsk agreement and seized the villages of the so-called "gray zone" of the DPR (Donetsk People's Republic).
  10. Night-time broadcast: Ukraine's military operations on its own territory for liberation of villages
- ✚ **Broadcasting 28.11.17**
  11. Day-time broadcast: According to Walker, the probability of a war in Donbas reaches 80%.
  12. Night-time broadcast: Deployment of Russian troops in Ukraine
- ✚ **Broadcasting 29.11.17**
  13. Day-time broadcast: An intercontinental ballistic missile was released in North Korea; The exchange of war prisoners between Ukraine and People's Republics of Donetsk and Luhansk.
  14. Night-time broadcast: Part 1 was dedicated to the provision of support to Russian families. Participants referred to the allocation of funds to families from the state budget, as well as the procurement of these funds. Discussion included only domestic issues and economy.  
Part II concerned the missile released by North Korea. In fact, both parties expressed their negative attitude towards the launch of the missile.
- ✚ **Broadcasting 30.11.17**
  15. Day-time broadcast: Relations between Russia and the USA
  16. Night-time broadcast: Rejection of accreditation for "Russia Today" TV channel by the US Congress
- ✚ **Broadcasting 01.12.17**

17. Day-time broadcast: Repentance letter of Kyiv Patriarch Filaret; NATO membership referendum in Ukraine.

18. Night-time broadcast: Ukrainian NATO membership

**✚ Broadcasting 04.12.17**

19. Day-time broadcast: Opposition Forum of “Free Russia” Foundation held in Vilnius

20. Night-time broadcast: Ksenia Sobchak as a presidential candidate was the guest speaker of Part I. She expressed her negative attitude towards the policy pursued by Russia in all spheres, blamed the authorities and complained of the domestic situation.

During Part II, guests advised against the anti-Russian forum held in Vilnius.

**✚ Broadcasting 05.12.17**

21. Day-time broadcast: Saakashvili's actions in Ukraine have been evaluated as a coup attempt. Discussion of the question of removing the Russian national team from the Winter Olympics.

22. Night-time broadcast: Disqualification of Russian sportsmen at the Olympics. Discussion of issues concerned with doping, as well as Saakashvili's arrest in Ukraine.

**✚ Broadcasting 06.12.17**

23. Day-time broadcast: Russian athletes can take part in the Olympic Games only under a white flag and without the national hymn.

24. Night-time broadcast: Putin's nomination in the presidential election. Discussion of candidates and the voting intentions of the public. Guest speakers mainly praised Putin stating that under President Putin, the stability of Russia has increased which is reflected by actual figures. It was also pointed out that Putin was the only candidate who could provide for both stability and development of the country. Crimea and the victory in Syria were mentioned among his accomplishments. The main message (indirect) was that Putin was the only possible candidate in the current complicated geopolitical situation full of dangers. It was clearly stated that he was the only person who had a real chance. They urged people to take part in the voting.

**✚ Broadcasting 07.12.17**

25. Day-time broadcast: Saakashvili has declared himself a Ukrainian savior.

26. Night-time broadcast: Saakashvili's arrest

**✚ Broadcasting 08.12.17**

27. Day-time broadcast: Situation in Ukraine

28. Night-time broadcast: Trump's statement on recognizing Jerusalem as the capital of Israel

**✚ Broadcasting 11.12.17**

29. Day-time broadcast: Putin in Syria; Partial withdrawal of Russian troops from Syria

30. Night-time broadcast: Liberation of Syria. Discussion of types of weapons that were used in the process of liberation.

✚ **Broadcasting** 12.12.17

31. Day-time broadcast 1. Ukraine; 2. Russian sportsmen participate in the Olympic games

32. Night-time broadcast: Relations between Russia and the USA

✚ **Broadcasting** 13.12.17

33. Day-time broadcast: Crimea

34. Night-time broadcast: Relations between Ukraine and Russia

✚ **Broadcasting** 14.12.17

35. Day-time broadcast: Putin's press-conference

✚ **Broadcasting** 15.12.17

36. Day-time broadcast: The incident between Russian and American planes in Syria's airspace.

37. Night-time broadcast: Russia-US relationship in the military sphere

✚ **Broadcasting** 18.12.17

38. Day-time broadcast: Ukraine

39. Night-time broadcast: Part I: Election programs of Zhirinovskiy. There was mainly criticism against Russia's foreign and domestic policies. Part II referred to the withdrawal of Russian troops from Ukraine.

✚ **Broadcasting** 19.12.17

40. Day-time broadcast: Ukrainian troops opened fire on Donbas (according to the information provided in the communication).

41. Night-time broadcast: Relationship with the United States

✚ **Broadcasting** 20.12.17

42. Day-time broadcast: Ukraine (United Nations General Assembly voted in favor of the resolution on human rights violations in Crimea. A resolution was adopted whereby Russia was named an occupying country).

43. Night-time broadcast: Current situation in Ukraine

✚ **Broadcasting** 21.12.17

44. Day-time broadcast: Ukraine

45. Night-time broadcast: Developments in Ukraine

In 25 out of 45 broadcasts monitored (in the main part of the broadcast, in some part of it or in whole), there were discussions on Ukraine, inter alia, on Maiden, Saakashvili and Donbas.

10 broadcasts were dedicated to the USA, Donald Trump and relations with certain western organizations.

Syria, North Korea and international relations have been referred to in a total of 8 broadcasts. The political issues of Russia, in particular the upcoming presidential elections, domestic policy, and mainly Putin's involvement and role were touched upon in 6 out of all monitored broadcasts. In 4 broadcasts, the issues regarding the disqualification of Russian athletes and the restriction of their participation in the Olympics were discussed and looked upon as an anti-Russian policy. Another 2 broadcasts were devoted to sanctions imposed on Russia.

It was particularly interesting to observe the guests of the talk show who acted as the main disseminators of propaganda. It is noteworthy that, unlike the "Time will show" talk show, an opportunity was also given to Ukrainian experts who presented alternative approaches and disputed the viewpoints expressed by other guests. Thus, the list of the most frequently invited, well-known guests and topics discussed within this TV program are presented below.

- ✚ Nikita Isayev, Head of “New Russia” political movement. Participated in 8 TV broadcasts and mainly talked about Ukraine, sanctions imposed on Russia, participation of Russian athletes in the Olympic Games under the white flag, Russia's domestic problems, the USA and Syria.
- ✚ Franc Klinevich, representative of the Russian Federation Defense and Security Committee. Participated in 7 broadcasts and touched upon the themes of United States, Ukraine and the West.
- ✚ Vadim Karasyov, political scientist (Ukraine). Participated in a total of 6 broadcasts presenting information about the situation in Ukraine.
- ✚ Oleg Nilov, member of the State Duma Transport Commission. Participated in 5 broadcasts and spoke about Ukraine, presidential elections in Russia, the USA.
- ✚ Leonid Kalashnikov, chairman of the State Duma Committee on CIS Affairs. Took part in 5 broadcasts and spoke mainly about Ukraine, presidential elections in Russia, the United States.
- ✚ Alexander Romanovich, “Fair Russia” Party. Participated in 4 broadcasts and touched upon Ukraine, the West and NATO.
- ✚ Vasil Vakarov, political scientist, Ukraine. Participated in 4 broadcasts presenting information about the situation in Ukraine.
- ✚ Vasil Volga, deputy of the 5<sup>th</sup> convocation of the Ukrainian Supreme Rada. Participated in 4 broadcasts speaking about Ukraine.
- ✚ Sergey Soudakov, correspondent member of the Russian Military Academy. Participated in 4 broadcasts and spoke about the United States, Korea, NATO.
- ✚ Vladimir Zhirinovski, leader of Liberal Democratic Party of Russia (LDPR). Took part in 4 broadcasts speaking about Russia's foreign policy, Ukraine and the United States.

- ✚ Igor Morozov, member of the Russian Federation Council on International Affairs. Participated in 4 broadcasts expressing opinion on both the United States and Ukraine and the domestic systems.
- ✚ Andreas Maurer, Left Party Faction (Germany). Participated in 3 broadcasts and mainly spoke about sanctions imposed on Russia.
- ✚ Yuri Afonin, member of the State Duma Natural Resources, Property Rights Commission. Participated in 3 broadcasts expressing opinion on the USA and Ukraine.
- ✚ Ilya Shablinski, member of the Human Rights Council adjunct to the President of the RF. Participated in 3 broadcasts and spoke mainly on the USA, Ukraine and sanctions against Russia.

It is noteworthy that certain statements and terminology have been repeatedly used and emphasized by guests of different broadcasts regardless of the issues on the agenda. For instance, the terms and statements used in regards to the *situation in Ukraine*, were aimed at sending the following messages to the audience:

- ✚ Ukraine was dreaming of becoming part of West, and if it succeeded, then only in becoming part of “Wild” West.
- ✚ The policy of separation of Ukraine from Russia is carried out by a well-known American method, according to which all ties with Russia should be broken.
- ✚ America has taken over the entire Ukraine and now controls it...
- ✚ Everything that you (Ukraine) are doing and producing today is of no need to Europe.
- ✚ The decision on separation was reached by the Crimean population through a referendum. When a provocation took place and thousands of Nazis got armed threatening to soak Crimea in blood, people made a decision about separation without any outside influence.
- ✚ Ukraine is making war against its own people in eastern Ukraine.
- ✚ You (Ukraine) should be ashamed for having such a president.
- ✚ Taking into account the Ukrainian authorities and pro-fascist organizations, it is high time for Ukraine to return its western territories to the countries which do not adopt such policies as fascism, for instance, to return Lvov to Poland.
- ✚ Walker has applied significant pressure on the Supreme Rada to accept a number of laws, such as law on Donbas Reintegration.
- ✚ Bandera is a national scale criminal and the whole Russian people supports this idea.
- ✚ Crimea is a land of conquest. It has always been conquered by someone. But Ukrainians did not conquer it. It was won by Russians from Turks, and for that sole reason Crimea is ours.
- ✚ Gross violation of Minsk agreement gives opportunity to raise issue on joining of People’s Republics of Luhansk and Donetsk to Russia.

- ✦ The population of Luhansk had no desire to live in Ukraine, but the people that came to power here were truly bandits. Once it turned out that the People's Republic of Lugansk had considerably weakened, some Ukrainian troops decided to take advantage of the situation and attacked its borders.
- ✦ Solidarity will be established in Donbas only when Russia and the United States come to agreement.
- ✦ Ukraine lives off the war, and if its financing is stopped and the external assistance is ceased, the Ukrainian economy will collapse, and then it will be necessary to restore the Ukrainian markets which are in Russia.
- ✦ The NATO membership referendum seems odd because no one in NATO waits for Ukraine, which has been repeatedly mentioned to Ukrainians. The reason is that NATO does not accept countries with current territorial disputes.
- ✦ Before our eyes, Ukraine is transformed into a backward African country, where social problems are not being solved and people are getting poorer.
- ✦ Notorious politician {Saakashvili}, who has already been expelled from his own country, will be forced to leave Ukraine as well.
- ✦ Saakashvili starts gathering bandits and people who seem inadequate, and law enforcement officials can do nothing about it.
- ✦ Ukraine has long been asking for being captured, and they would prefer to be captured by Americans because the latter have a lot of money, whereas Europe does not have much attraction as an occupier.
- ✦ Ukraine claims to become a proper, strong Nazi state.
- ✦ Crimea is our {Russian} historical homeland. It is our territory illegally transferred to Ukraine by Khrushyov. Crimea has always been and will be ours.
- ✦ After Ukraine, Americans are preparing to start a military conflict in the territory of Moldova.
- ✦ All actions of the Ukrainian authorities are dictated by Washington. Washington makes use of the Ukrainian conflict to extend sanctions against Russia, to set up a negative agenda around Russia, as well as to preclude Russia and Ukraine from forming a union.
- ✦ We all were surprised by the hypocrisy of the USA. You {Ukrainians} are begging them to supply you with weapon. They say that they will not provide you with weapon, yet they do. Thus, they talk about regulating the Ukrainian conflict and at the same time provide Ukraine with mortars.
- ✦ Ukraine has no other option than being with Russia.

- ✚ Donbas was the first to protest against the nationalist, bandit regime which took power in Kiev. We need to provide the maximum possible support to Donbas to prevent these nationalist, bandit formations from spreading.
- ✚ Ukraine is not regarded as a private matter, it is a special policy of the USA addressed at us, and democracy is out of the question here.
- ✚ There is nothing to discuss about Crimea. Crimea belongs to us! (*to Russia*)

During discussions on *Russia's international relations*, the following viewpoints regarding the United States, Syria, NATO and UN have been emphasized:

- ✚ I wish I could believe to the UN, but for some reason I can't. Recently, they have shown how far they are from being objective.
- ✚ The United States is trying to test Russia's strength, but they themselves are riddled with problems.
- ✚ NATO insists that its mission has always been and remains in protection, but I want to remind you that in 1999 NATO, as a peacekeeping force, attacked Yugoslavia using weapons with enriched uranium. NATO performs "protection" in Afghanistan as well, but they prefer to keep silent about it.
- ✚ OSCE is closing its eyes on whatever Kiev does.
- ✚ Europe fully depends on the United States.
- ✚ The biggest problem is not that the USA does not believe this conflict can be settled, but that the USA does not want it to be settled.
- ✚ The USA drags out the Ukraine conflict because it has a keen interest to see Russia getting involved in a conflict and paying a great deal of money to resolve it. There is no doubt that Europe will also support Ukraine.
- ✚ The presence of American troops in Syria is illegal. Even after completion of military operations, Americans continue to maintain tension. During Soviet times they used to respect and be afraid of the Soviet Union. Now they are afraid of Russia. We must make them respect us as well.
- ✚ The intensity of Russian bombing in Syria was several times weaker than that of any bombing conducted by the USA within the last decade.
- ✚ Operations in Syria were carried out by the authorities of Russia, Iran and Syria. In Syria, Iran, unlike the United States, has acted as the most active and consistent regional fighter against terrorism and IS.
- ✚ We wished to defeat the IS, but we were openly threatened by America.

- ✚ The fact that America promotes the establishment of the IS, is supported by enormous evidence.
- ✚ Americans have always violated the norms of international law as well as their domestic legislation.
- ✚ The USA has big plans of destabilizing the upcoming elections in Russia.
- ✚ PACE has been missing the 11 million paid by us, that is why they want our membership back.
- ✚ We are not a member of the EU: what's happening inside Russia is none of their business.
- ✚ The difference between us and them is small, it's that we don't teach freedom and democracy to the whole world, but the United States, which has neither freedom nor democracy, try to teach it to everyone.
- ✚ Americans supported not only Kurds, but also Islamist radicals - people who were in fact terrorists, murderers.
- ✚ Americans have used the IS only to influence the situation in Syria against Damascus, and therefore against us, Russia.

Referring to the *domestic developments and situation*, the main messages addressed to the audience were as follows:

- ✚ Putin declared that all enterprises should be ready for working in military regime and did this not to win the elections - he has already won them the day before - but to make the West aware about it and spread it through the media.
- ✚ Dissatisfaction with the sanctions imposed on Russia is growing among Europeans as they also suffer from Russia's "counter-sanctions".
- ✚ Today we (Russia) are a small island of truth in the western world of fake news.
- ✚ Through these sanctions, America also addresses the issue of global domination, that is finding way to manage Europe.
- ✚ Russia has a significant impact on the development of the **world**. Russia has shown to the United States that it has still a stronger position than it had before. The United States will always be our opponent.
- ✚ We will attack, we have enough weapons against those who are preparing a plan against us.

*Thus, resuming the series of these broadcasts, it can be definitely concluded that, by successively streamed broadcasts, the talk show seeks to communicate the following ideas to its audience:*

1. *Ukrainian movements are organized, financed and directed by the United States and Europe, as a result of which Ukraine makes war with itself, turning the country into an illegal state.*

2. *What happens in Ukraine is fascism and terrorism.*
3. *Declaration of independence of Donetsk and Luhansk is the decision of the conscious local population.*
4. *Ukraine has no other option but to be with Russia.*
5. *Crimea has always been and will be a Russian territory.*
6. *Sahakashvili is the main evil, which draws together bandits and scoundrels, whereas government officials are unable to prevent him from actively engaging in Ukrainian developments.*
7. *The United States drags out the Ukrainian conflict because it has a keen interest to see Russia involved in a conflict.*
8. *Russia wished to defeat the IS, but was openly threatened by America as far as America itself is providing support to the establishment of the IS.*
9. *The USA has always violated norms of the international law.*
10. *The United States, which don't have freedom and democracy, try to teach it to the whole world.*
11. *Russia is a powerful country which cannot be compromised by any sanctions imposed on it. Russia has a significant impact on the development of the world.*

#### 4.3. "Evening with Vladimir Solovyov"

*The overall impression of this three-hour talk show, broadcasted in a five-day mode, is that its main purpose is to provide Mr. V. Solovyov with the opportunity to express his own attitude towards the topic of the day through a couple of well-balanced, accurate words uttered in between the statements of the guest speakers. Undoubtedly, his attitude greatly influences national moods, which is facilitated by his high intellect, complete awareness, apparent assertiveness, as well as by the extra weight added to his words by rounds of applause of the audience sitting in the auditorium. He does not consider himself propagandist as, in his own words, there is no concept of "propaganda"; instead, the journalists can either speak the truth, which cannot be considered propaganda, or spread false facts for which they may face prosecution. V. Solovyov attempts to persuade his broad audience that the program is not constrained by any political views and is free to make its own decisions, since it provides a tribune to liberals and dissenters allowing them to communicate different opinions in live stream. Indeed, the talk show hosts people with pro-Putin, anti-Ukrainian, anti-American views, alongside with people who express views deemed anti-*

*Putin, pro-Ukrainian and strictly liberal. However, the latter are either selected by specific criteria or act according to the pre-designated plan: they seem to lack acute intellect, are not good at debating, are easily confused and are inferior to their opponents in reasoning and critical thinking skills. They are often indifferent to an obvious or disguised mockery of themselves or their country. Yet, criticism addressed to Putin and his policy as well as to the anti-Ukrainian or the anti-American mood existing in Russia is not uncommon here (for example, "Russia has taken advantage of Ukraine's weakness and has implemented its long-desired plan"; "No one should stay in power for 18 years. It brings to boundless corruption. Our population grew poorer; we are involved in two wars"; "The winner of the elections is quite obvious, which means another six years of stagnation"; "The President's high credibility shows the good work performed not by the President, but by your [Solovyov's] talk show and that of your colleagues"; "Anti-Americanism is an image of an artificially created enemy served to people to divert their attention from the content of their pockets", etc.).*

During the targeted period, a total of 19 broadcasts have been monitored, the main topics of which are outlined below:

1. Dignity and Freedom Day in Ukraine (broadcast on 21.11.17 )
2. Russia has become the main moderator in Syria and the entire Middle East (22.11.17)
3. Hague International Tribunal has sentenced Ratko Mladic to life imprisonment (23.11.17)
4. Russian Foreign Policy (26.11.17)
5. Domestic policy: whom does the Russian population trust? (27.11.17)
6. Russia – Ukraine (28.11.17)
7. New sanctions against Russia (29.11.17)
8. Foreign Policy (30.11.17)
9. a) International politics (allegations against former US National Security Adviser Michael Flynn), b) Sanctions against Russia, c) NATO membership referendum in Ukraine (03.12.17)
10. a) Putin intends to announce his candidacy; b) Ukraine (10.12.17)
11. Russia withdraws troops from Syria; Putin welcomes Russian soldiers in Syria (11.12.17)
12. Ukraine (12.12.17)
13. America speaks with the world in the language of force (13.12.17)
14. Putin's press-conference (14.12.17)
15. a) International relations; b) Presidential elections (17.12.17)
16. a) Ukraine; b) Sanctions imposed on Russia (18.12.17)
17. a) International relations, b) US National Strategy (19.12.17)

18. a) Ukraine; b) By the decision of the UN General Assembly, Russia has been recognized as an occupying country; c) International relations (20.12.17)
19. International relations (21.12.17)

10 out of all broadcasts monitored were dedicated to the USA, the West, Syria and Russia's foreign policy.

Discussions regarding Ukraine, in particular, the Maidan, Mikheil Saakashvili, Crimea and Donbas took place in 7 out of 19 broadcasts.

4 out of 19 broadcasts were dedicated to discussion of Russia's domestic political issues, particularly the presidential elections due on March 18, 2018, as well as to the role and involvement of Putin. Another two broadcasts were devoted to sanctions imposed on Russia.

It was particularly interesting to learn about guests of the program who were the actual disseminators of propaganda. Thus, the list of guests most frequently invited to the program, as well as the topics discussed, is presented below.

- ✚ Sergey Mikheev, political scientist. Took part in 6 broadcasts and spoke about foreign policy, Russia's pre-election campaign, the United States, Ukraine, Putin.
- ✚ Vladimir Kornilov, political correspondent of "Russia Today" International Agency. Participated in 5 broadcasts and mainly spoke about Ukraine and the United States.
- ✚ Semyon Baghdasarov, Director of Research Center for countries of Middle East and Central Asia. Took part in 4 broadcasts discussing issues regarding Middle East, the West, the United States.
- ✚ Vladimir Zhirinovski, Leader of the Liberal Democratic Party of Russia (LDPR). Appeared in 4 broadcasts expressing his attitude towards the situation in Middle East, the USA, Putin.
- ✚ Yakov Kedmi, Israeli public figure. Participated in 4 broadcasts mainly making statements about Syria, the USA, the international situation, Ukraine, the UN.
- ✚ Yevgeni Satanovski, President of the Institute for Middle East. Appeared in 4 broadcasts mainly speaking about Ukraine, Russia and the United States.
- ✚ Nikolay Zlobin, Chairman of the Global Interest Center (USA). Participated in 4 broadcasts mainly making statements concerning Russian foreign policy as well as the United States.
- ✚ Karen Shahnazarov, Film Director. Appeared in 4 broadcasts and spoke about Ukraine, the USA, Putin as well as Russia's domestic political life.
- ✚ V. Nikonov, Education Committee of the State Duma. Participated in 4 broadcasts and mainly touched upon the topics of the USA and NATO.
- ✚ Ariel Koen, Atlantic Council Chief Expert, the USA. Appeared in 4 broadcasts mainly making statements on the USA, Russia and Europe.

- ✚ Vadim Tryukhan, Chairman of the Management Board of the "European Movement of Ukraine" NGO. Participated in 3 broadcasts referring exclusively to Ukraine.
- ✚ Franc Klincevich, Defense and Security Committee of the RF Federation Council. Participated in 3 broadcasts and exclusively spoke about the United States.

It is noteworthy that certain statements and terminology have been repeatedly used and emphasized by guests of different broadcasts regardless of the issues on the agenda. For instance, the terms and statements used in regards to the *situation in Ukraine*, were aimed at sending the audience the following messages:

- ✚ Ukraine is entirely dependent on the will of the USA, thus can hardly be considered a free country.
- ✚ The Ukrainians realize the extent to which the quality of life has diminished as compared with the times of Yanukovich. People leave the country because of poverty, corruption, and unlawfulness.
- ✚ Ukraine has not made any step towards the European path of development.
- ✚ Political freedoms and rights are next to elimination, and people are unable to defend themselves. Freedom and dignity have become a beautiful veil to cover the biggest crime made against the Ukrainians when they are robbed and plundered under lofty words.
- ✚ Ukraine ranks first in the number of crimes and in the level of poverty in Europe. This is where the revolution brought them.
- ✚ Over the past 22 years, the Ukrainians have failed as a nation.
- ✚ The Maidan has opened a huge hole for Ukraine to fall into and collapse.
- ✚ Ukraine will lose Donbas and Luhansk due to its nationalist attitude. Ukraine should eliminate nationalism and join Russia. Ukraine has no other option.
- ✚ Russia has always regarded Ukraine as an area for running its gas pipeline.
- ✚ Everything happening in Ukraine today can be called only one thing, that is “zoocratia”, a power of beasts, which do not respect neither a man’s freedom nor his life.
- ✚ I would put Saakashvili at one wall and Poroshenko at the other and would shoot them both, and Yanukovich would be put between the two for being a coward and a traitor.
- ✚ The bloody circus in Ukraine lasted for four years now. There does not exist a single house where people feel protected. Here applies the right of the strong, the right of the one who holds a gun, especially if that gun is in the hands of a sworn nationalist who has been granted amnesty after the Maidan.
- ✚ The Maidan of Ukraine did not involve students, only envoys of western countries and Bandera supporters.

Within this talk show, a well-arranged propaganda was carried out in regards to *the policy pursued by Russia*, which was aimed at presenting Russia as a powerful peacekeeping state with a strong democratic leader. The opinions most often heard in this regard, included:

- ✚ Russia controls the rules of the game in the Middle East, it does not allow NATO to expand in the post-Soviet space, it limits the ambitions of the USA and does not allow Europe to break away from reality. In general, the Russian policy is effective, and the West is having a very tough time accepting it.
- ✚ Unlike America, Russia did not impose its ideas and thoughts during the negotiations toward peace in the East.
- ✚ Russians living abroad have begun to respect Russia.
- ✚ It is necessary to continue the activities in the post-Soviet space, including the Eurasian Union, and try to create an opportunity for Russia to receive something from the participant countries, rather than constantly provide them with its own resources.
- ✚ According to the results of the polls, the number one politician, who enjoys the trust of the Russian population, is certainly Putin. More than 50% of the population trusts him.
- ✚ In his foreign policy, Putin aspires to establish friendly relations with all countries and shows respect to people. He is regarded as a figure who relies both on liberals and conservatives and is able to provide both stability and progress of the country.
- ✚ Look at the number of utterly liberal media existing in Russia and at the number of politicians standing in front of any tribune! You are a person with liberal opinions, yet no one deprives you of the opportunity to speak on the federal TV channel.
- ✚ Unlike America, we help someone when we are asked to. We helped Syria when it asked us for help. But the United States "protects" everyone by intervening in their internal affairs.
- ✚ People support Putin because they consider him a strong leader who, among other things, managed to improve the economy of the country.
- ✚ When we choose Putin, we choose a leader. We trust him and give him our votes. His development program, i.e. what and how he's going to do, is not even taken into account. I personally will vote for him because for me it's obvious that he has done much over the past 15 years. He restored the country, he strengthened the sovereignty of Russia and placed it among other powerful countries.
- ✚ Three damaging blows are planned against Russia: sanctions against Russian enterprises, sale of deadly weapons to Ukraine by Canada and restriction of the export of Russian hydrocarbons to Europe.

At the same time, special attention should be paid to the terms used to present the USA and Western countries, their structures and political figures, including, inter alia, the following statements:

- # The West believes that the USA lost to the Sochi trio - Russia, Iran and Turkey.
- # America seeks to tighten sanctions against certain Russian businessmen in order to force them to put pressure on Putin and launch a revolution.
- # I'm very well aware of the American working methods which fascists have used at the time, testing them here on our land.
- # The number of NATO countries has doubled: they have approached our borders and have thrown us out of all the possible institutions. We have no basis for trusting the West.
- # When Americans come to a country, they break down its political system, they pursue their national interests and then they go away, leaving nothing but empty space. When the Russian army comes (Afghanistan, Syria), it creates a certain environment for people to live in.
- # America does not need negotiations and compromises. America wants us to obey it. And we do not obey America. They therefore seek to destabilize the situation inside the country through sanctions or make the Russian elite focus on its disadvantageous condition.
- # America has gathered a group of countries around itself and is pushing them to attack Russia using whatever method they can. There were rules in the "Old Cold War", something that is lacking at present.
- # Today's American newspapers do not say any truth about Russia because a severe anti-Russian campaign is underway in America.
- # America wants to overthrow Russia which means that sanctions will be intensified and the USA will supply ammunition to Ukraine to provoke escalation.
- # You (Americans) rip off all the countries, leaving nothing to them. You cheat the countries with your SOROS, taking away all good specialists, scientists, engineers from all over the world. But we do not make people come to us, we accept them when they ask us for it.
- # The USA will no longer feed Ukraine. Their goal is to start a conflict with Russia, and when Ukraine finally collapses, they will tell us: "Make them rise again because they're your brothers", while Russia has so many domestic issues to deal with.
- # America creates chaos, whereas Russia makes peace. Peace is the main credit which belongs to our foreign policy.
- # Western power is tough and strong. Try not to disagree with the US policy, and "democratic" bombers will come to your country and carry out a "democratic" bombing.

- ✚ The U.S. Department of State finances non-governmental organizations for the transformation of Ukraine.
- ✚ The USA executed a coup d'état in Ukraine.

*Thus, resuming the series of these broadcasts, it can be definitely concluded that the talk show skillfully propagates the below-mentioned key ideas through viewpoints expressed by credible people and, in particular, by Vladimir Solovyov:*

- 1. The President of the Russian Federation Vladimir Putin enjoys unlimited trust and respect of the overwhelming majority of Russian citizens, being characterized by exemplary personal and professional qualities. His victory in the upcoming elections is beyond any doubt.*
- 2. Domestic development of Russia is on the right track due to Putin's effective policy. There are clear manifestations of economic growth and general development in the country.*
- 3. Russia controls the rules of the game in the Middle East, it limits the ambitions of the USA, and the West has a very tough time accepting it and resorts to various means, including the creation and maintenance of the Ukrainian conflict in order to weaken Russia. Thus, the Ukrainian Maidan was nothing but a blind instrument in the hands of the United States. Russia is the number one enemy of the USA. The latter imposes sanctions to destabilize Russia's domestic situation and make Russian population believe that they are in poor condition.*
- 4. Crimea historically belongs to Russia. In fact, there had been not an annexation of Crimea by Russia, but the acceptance of Crimea into the Russian Federation at its own request. If Russia had not supported the Crimean population, it would have been subjected to severe persecutions by Kiev and would have been drenched in blood.*
- 5. Ukraine ranks first in the number of crimes and in the level of poverty in Europe. This is where the revolution brought them. Ukraine is entirely dependent on the will of the USA, thus can hardly be considered a free country. Ukrainian citizens leave the country because of poverty, corruption, and unlawfulness.*
- 6. America does not respect any agreement and does not comply with any international law; it intervenes in the internal affairs of all countries and has destroyed a large number of people in many countries in order to establish its "democratic" regime. According to the American strategy, what differs from the American opinion is wrong and therefore subject to correction. The correction is made by various means, mostly by military force. America creates chaos in the world.*

#### 4.4. “Countdown”

*In contrast to Russian programs, this Armenian program is weak enough from the perspective of rhetoric. During the broadcasting one acute question can be asked, however it is not the author’s initial but is based on someone’s viewpoint. The questions are prepared in advance, from which the author does not diverge and taking the direction of the guest’s speech/ideas even does not lead the conversation to another platform. Therefore the discussion can’t be “interesting”, effective or full of conflicting viewpoints.*

During the targeted period overall 23 programs were monitored, the main topics of which were;

1. **Broadcasting** 21.11.2017

*Topic* – vaccination against papillomavirus. There was no direct emphasis on the spread of this vaccination by any country.

2. **Broadcasting** 21.11.2017

*Topic* – Syrian crisis was the victory of Russian troops.

3. **Broadcasting** 23.11.2017

*Topic* –the conflict settlement of Artsakh, only the presidents’ meetings and Azerbaijani standpoint were discussed.

4. **Broadcasting** 24.11.2017

*Topic* - Armenia-EU comprehensive and expanded cooperation agreement

5. **Broadcasting** 27.11.2017

*Topic* – Turkey-NATO relations

6. **Broadcasting** 28.11.2017

*Topic*- Foreign policy of Armenia, assignment of the agreement with EU

7. **Broadcasting** 29.11.2017

*Topic* – Armenian-Iranian relations

8. **Broadcasting** 30.11.2017

*Topic*- Compulsory Enforcement Service of Judicial Acts of the RA

9. **Broadcasting** 01.12.2017

*Topic*- Georgian-Armenian relations, particularly the postponement of Georgian prime minister’s visit to Armenia

10. **Broadcasting** 01.12.2017

*Topic*- Draft accepted by CSTO member state’s presidents in Minsk about peaceful solution to Karabakh conflict

11. **Broadcasting** 05.12.2017

*Topic*- Education in Armenia

12. **Broadcasting** 06.12.2017

*Topic*- 4 Turkish intellectuals visit Artsakh in September

13. **Broadcasting** 07.12.2017

*Topic*- Summit of parties of 126 countries' in Beijing

14. **Broadcasting** 08.12.2017

*Topic*- Trump's suggestion to make Jerusalem the capital of Israel

15. **Broadcasting** 11.12.2017

*Topic*- Armenian foreign policy and its influence on internal situation.

16. **Broadcasting** - 12.12.2017

*Topic* – Trump's declaration to remove the capital of Israel to Jerusalem, the relations with Turkey.

17. **Broadcasting** 13.12.2017

*Topic*–New tax code.

18. **Broadcasting** 14.12.2017

*Topic*-Discussion of new customs' code.

19. **Broadcasting** 15.12.2017

*Topic*- Ammunition of Armenia and Azerbaijan (types, quantity and so on)

20. **Broadcasting** 18.12.2017

Topic – Food safety (before Christmas)

21. **Broadcasting** 19.12.2017

Topic- Meeting organized by supporters of Saakashvili in Ukraine

22. **Broadcasting** 20.12.2017

*Topic*– About bitcoins

23. **Broadcasting** 21.12.2017

*Topic*- Relations of the USA and Islamic states (mainly with Turkey).

The main topics of monitored programs refer to current problems in the country, and the foreign policy as well. Only a little part of the programs are dedicated to Syria, the US, Trump and the Ukraine, during which there was no an obviously highlighted and extensive propaganda, unlike Russian channels. Sometimes invited guests or more often broadcaster expressed such ideas and viewpoints that were directed to Armenian audience but, as a rule, they repeat the same viewpoints and ideas expressed by Russians in the same period of time.

Unlike Russian programs, Armenian *program guests* were exclusively professionals, experts, or government officials directly related to the subject of the discussion and the same guest never participated in different topic discussions. So here is the list of guests of monitored programs.

- ✚ Anahit Harutyunyan, International Academy of Education
- ✚ Arman Abovyan, political expert
- ✚ David Ananyan, deputy finance minister
- ✚ Mushegh Khudaverdyan, Turkologist
- ✚ Karen Veranyan, Israeli expert
- ✚ Hermine Naghdalyan, the director of Armenia—China relations group,
- ✚ Aragats Akhoyan, the director of “Return” foundation
- ✚ David Hovhannisyanyan, expert of Islamic
- ✚ Karen Chilingaryan director of “Consumers’ consulting center” non-governmental organization
- ✚ Leonid Nersisyan, military expert
- ✚ Arman Poghosyan, head of SRC administration methodology, procedures and service department of RA
- ✚ Mihran Hakobyan, member of RPA party
- ✚ Hakov Chakryan, Turkologist
- ✚ Armen Petrosyan, orientalist
- ✚ Menua Harutyunyan, political commentator
- ✚ Nark Minasyan, expert in “Insight” Analytical Center for Applied Policy and Research
- ✚ Anna Karapetyan, expert in “Insight” Analytical Center for Applied Policy and Research
- ✚ Armen Israelyan, Iranian expert
- ✚ Ara, Karakhanyan, chief compulsory enforcement officer
- ✚ Alik Eroyants, expert on Georgia
- ✚ Garik Qeryan, political expert

Monitoring those messages, provided to the audience and mainly qualified as propaganda, especially about the *US, Europe and Syria* is formulated as,

- ✚ It is obvious who directs Assad and he goes to its savior Putin.
- ✚ The purpose of Putin-Trump phone conversation is to come to a common agreement on foreign relations.
- ✚ The US and Europe want to see Syria without Assad in the future.
- ✚ Oil and natural resources in Syria are controlled by Assad and behind him is Putin.
- ✚ Should America, in the face of blond billionaire, admire all of this (Syrian situation)?

- ✚ Neither in Iraq, nor in Syria the struggle against Islamic State can be so quick without the US.
- ✚ According to some resources, the actions of Islamic State is the US handwriting.
- ✚ Regionally, Iran is the most powerful (in the struggle against IS).

Speaking about EU and EEU, the main emphasis in messages have been:

- ✚ Some EU drafts are not so useful, they intrude into our families. EEU doesn't contain such hazards.
- ✚ The law on domestic violence is beneficial for the supporters of globalization. Through such laws they want to decay and weaken our country. With the help of these laws they promote the idea of unisex families.
- ✚ The US wants to warn Turkey not to play tricks with Russia.
- ✚ It is said, that EU is falling, and it has no future.
- ✚ President of Armenia has made such a diplomatic path, that many countries can be surprised with.
- ✚ Armenia will not act against military-political field (this is about Russia).
- ✚ EU signed agreement with Armenia for its own safety that is to raise its level in the region.
- ✚ In the EU agreement there are instructions for every sphere to direct how Armenia should act. According to that agreement Armenia passes to external administration.
- ✚ The economy of Moldova is ruined, it is governed by two powers. The Ukraine is ruined. The only benefit is visa that will let us "aborigines" enter Europe, after fulfilling their demands.
- ✚ After signing the agreement we become competitors with Georgia in the region of Southern Caucasus.
- ✚ Russia tries to find a solution to retain Russian-Azerbaijani relations enabling membership of Azerbaijan in Eurasian Economic Union.

The viewpoints about the *Ukraine and especially about Saakashvili* were the following, which were similar to those expressed during Russian programs.

- ✚ Saakashvili's arrival to the Ukraine was not a surprise. It was a seriously organized process.
- ✚ I consider him a negative person because he is and has been protégé of Turkey and Azerbaijan.
- ✚ Nobody hid that Saakashvili was one of remarkable landings delegates sent by the US.
- ✚ Saakashvili is an absolutely controlled factor. He is an important figure but on the other hand a trick player in the Ukraine.
- ✚ It was an interesting game for government to release Saakashvili according to the court's decision.

✚ Saakashvili is one of several destabilizing and constraining mechanisms.

*Thus, resuming the abovementioned, it can be stated that Russian influence on choosing the topics of Armenian broadcastings and discussing contents of materials is obvious in case of international events, especially when it comes to discuss something about the Ukraine, Syria and Russian humanitarian and peacekeeping role.*

## V. SPECIAL OVERVIEW

### *5.1 Reflection of Russian mass media to the initialing of the agreement between Armenia and EU*

Albeit, Russian TV channels “Zvezda” and NTV (HTB) have not been monitored, but two highlighted anti-Armenian TV programs couldn’t be withdrawn from the sight of the definite analysis during the period of the indicated monitoring. And the abovementioned TV programs immediately preceded and followed the assignment of Armenia-EU comprehensive and expanded cooperation agreement on the 24<sup>th</sup> of November 2017 in Brussels.

On the 19<sup>th</sup> of November 2017 during the broadcasting Russian Ministry of Defense’s TV channel “Zvezda” blamed Armenian Government of praising fascism. During the program ‘Predictions’ the director of Foreign Policy Research and Initiatives Institute, advisor to the general director of “Russian Day” daily Veronica Krasheninikova, interpreting the signing of the agreement between Armenia and EU, reminded that Yerevan glorifies fascist criminals. She also mentioned that being EEU and CSTO member, and Russian main ally in Southern Caucasus, in a few days Armenia would sign up a comprehensive and expanded cooperation agreement with European Union during the “Eastern Cooperation” summit in Brussels. The announcer has mocked, “As the Ukraine, Armenia is also involving in political dialogue to increase the efficiency of foreign policy and the cooperation in case of defense.”

“The cooperation with European Union is not the only matter Armenia acts like the Ukraine once used to. It is difficult to believe, but Armenia praises fascism supporters, as well.” So, the monument of Armenian Bandera Garegin Nzhdeh was erected in Yerevan in May. Veronica Krasheninikova underlined that in 1942 Nzhdeh applied to the Third Reich to make Soviet Armenia a German colony. He was the one who established an Armenian SS legion and convinced Armenian prisoners, “The one who died for Germany died also for Armenia,” highlighted Veronica Krasheninikova.

The announcer mentioned that the monument has been erected by the Armenian Government, which is a thorough offense for the Armenians, who had courageously fought during the World War II and 106 of which had become heroes of the Soviet Union.

“In this case ruling Republican Party of Armenia considers Nzhdeh a hero,” clarified Krasheninikova.

The announcer has also noticed that RPA logo resembles Nazi symbol (swastika) and the leadership of the party doesn't deny this resemblance.

“Recently I have had an opportunity to meet the RPA leadership. It is unbelievable but as an answer to the question about logo one of the leaders has mentioned that “Yes, we are Aryans.” It seems to me that we know nothing about the representatives of Armenian ruling circles. Whether they will lead Armenia the way the Ukraine has done”, the announcer concluded her speech with this question.

On the 29<sup>th</sup> of November, 2017 on HTB Russian channel the main part of the TV program “Meeting place” was devoted to the theme why Brussels accepts Armenia to “Eastern Cooperation” project. “Meeting place” is an everyday social and political program.

During the program headed “If the relative suddenly becomes...” it became known that for the first time Armenia was suggested to sign a cooperation agreement in 2013, but at that time Yerevan rejected to sign it.

Four years later several important points were removed from the agreement and Armenia offered to sign the agreement. According to the new agreement Yerevan will receive means of development of civil society and also anti-corruption tools and opportunity to bring Armenian business to European market.

One of the program guests political scientist Oleg Barabanov has mentioned in his speech that Europe doesn't need Armenia. “The problem is very clear, that is to cause a disagreement within Eurasian Union, which just starts to develop. Here the problem is in Armenia, not in Europe,” he said.

“In 2013 Armenia was conditionally free and could choose between Eurasian Union and European Union. The former chose Eurasian Economic Union, and now Armenia is not free, it is

the member of Eurasian Economic Union. We have no borders within the Custom Union and Armenia has become the Trojan Horse,” he added.

The announcer of the TV program Olga Belova has compared Armenia with a married wife, who is not satisfied with the relationships with her legal husband and wants to have a lover. And after this comparison the term “Armenia as the Russian Federation’s traitor wife” was repeated many times by program experts.

The director of the Institution of Political Studies Sergey Markov mentioned that the signing of this agreement shows deterioration of relations with Armenia.

“There are complaints about Russia in Yerevan that it donates a little money. We have a discrepancy about Nzhdeh, who has been a close friend of Adolf Hitler. In Armenia there is a monument dedicated to Nzhdeh calling him a national hero. There are attempts to influence Russian TV channels. Whatever they say, Nzhdeh has been a Nazi criminal,” he said.

### ***5.2 Reflection of Armenian mass media to the non-governmental organizations***

On the 7<sup>th</sup> of September 2017 the program “Countdown” on Ararat TV channel was completely dedicated to non-governmental organizations and the guest of the program was military-political analyst Hayk Nahapetyan. The main focus of the program was to represent the audience the aims of the non-governmental organizations and as announcer mentioned, where those organization are financed from and what is their function.

The core requests of the announcer were about the matter, why foreign institutions to act in social and cultural spheres should finance non-governmental organizations. In response, the guest of the program announced that through local non-governmental organizations those foreign institutions implement their profitable agenda and assist the interests of their own countries, especially mentioning that there are dozens of such non-governmental organizations in Armenia whose activities are not beneficial for Armenia.

The invited guest indicated the names of international organizations, which being foreign residents or representatives of foreign countries finance Armenian organizations, especially

- ✚ Open Society Foundations Armenia,
- ✚ United States Agency for International Development,
- ✚ Heinrich Boell Foundation,
- ✚ Netherlands Embassy in Georgia,
- ✚ McArthur Foundation,
- ✚ European Union,

✚ International association of lesbians and gays.

The main purpose of listing and speech orientation led to the idea that the abovementioned organizations under the mask of supporting are evil in fact. It is noteworthy, that a lot of time is dedicated to the representation of collection of signatures in 2017 during which a certain group of the US citizens appealed to the US President to declare George Soros a terrorist.

The guest of the program as a proven fact has represented that Soros is a colorful revolution funding and supporting institution in different countries and by funding Armenian organization it doesn't have charitable purposes. To be more convincing the guest listed organizations and the names of their directors, labeling them as assistants for the interests of foreign countries and expanding conflicting expert opinions about Armenia and its alliances. Experts who serve as political rather than social experts.

- ✚ Stepan Grigoryan, “Analytical Centre on Globalization and Regional Cooperation” NGO,
- ✚ Levon Barseghyan, “Asparez Journalists’ Club” NGO,
- ✚ Arthur Sakunts, “Helsinki Citizens’ Assembly Vanadzor Office” NGO,
- ✚ Avetik Ishkhanyan, “Armenian Helsinki Committee” NGO,
- ✚ Stepan Danielyan, «Collaboration for Democracy» NGO.

In contrast with the abovementioned organizations the guest mentioned another separate group of non-governmental organizations related to women and children's rights (Maro Matevosyan, “Women's Support Centre”, Lala Aharonyan “Women's Resource Centre”, Jemma Hasratyan “Association of Women with University Education”). Reporting the following names the guest underlined that their purpose is not to provide protection for children's rights but endorsement of certain rights, which will implement the protection of pervert people (author's word), there will be established legal strategies to take away children from their families, or propaganda of homosexuality and so on.

It was more remarkable the guests statement, that during the capture of PPS regiment the abovementioned Armenian organizations through expanding certain information implemented kit of tools used during the armed conflicts in other countries. After all, the announcer concluded, that the purpose of foreign funding and non-governmental organizations is the deviation of society and destabilization of a state and asked the guest to clarify the aims of such actions. The latter responded that future discredited, perverted, alcoholic, and drug addicted generation will be more vulnerable and easy controlling for foreign governments that have their own interests in Armenia. The guest touched upon non-governmental organizations acting as means of mass media, especially [www.hetq.am](http://www.hetq.am), the director of which is Edik Baghdasaryan and organizations which are “Investigative Journalists” and “Article 3 Club” directed by Gayane Abrahamyan, who is the most active person praising homosexuality in Armenia according to the guest.

Summarizing his speech the guest of the program has offered a solution to this problem that is to endorse a law in Armenia, as Russia has done, due to which the abovementioned organizations will be qualified as foreign agents and people will know with whom they deal.

## VI. ARMENIAN PRINTED AND ELECTRONIC MASS MEDIA MONITORING

From 15<sup>th</sup> of September up to 15<sup>th</sup> of December, 2017 the results of monitoring 5 printed (“Aravot,” “Hraparak,” “Hayoc Ashxarh” dailies, “Irates” published once per two days and “Iravunq” published once per three days) and 5 online media ([www.regnum.ru](http://www.regnum.ru), [www.vesti.am](http://www.vesti.am), [www.armeniasputnik.am](http://www.armeniasputnik.am), [www.nt.am](http://www.nt.am), [www.tert.am](http://www.tert.am)) available in Armenia are represented separately.

### *6.1 “Aravot” daily*

The newspaper is published 5 days in a week (except for Sunday and Monday). From September until December there are no analyses concerning the topics of monitoring. There is one interview about West and six interviews about European values and also two event news for each theme. There are no articles about non-governmental organizations or crises in the Ukraine and Syria. In October and November there is one interview about West, 13 analyses about European values and 10 items of news concerning monitoring themes. There are 4 items of news about non-governmental organizations and there is no news about the crises in the Ukraine and Syria. In November and December there are 4 interviews about West, 15 analyses about European values, 15 interviews and 20 items of news. In this case, interviews with supporters of Europe and European integration are prevailing. There are no articles about non-governmental organizations and Syrian crises. There are 3 items of news about the Ukraine, which are mainly about actions initiated by ex-President of Georgia M. Saakashvili.

There are no definite political orientations in the articles; the right of speech is given to figures having diverse outlooks.

The newspaper also discusses the refusal of Armenian brandy brand after signing agreement between RA and EU. Ambassador of France to Armenia has mentioned in his interview that it is normal that Armenia should respect the rules of the game. The head of EU delegation in Armenia Piotr Switalski has also clarified that changing brandy and champagne labels are inevitable. After signing agreement the newspaper has published one full page of exclusive interview with Piotr Switalski. The ambassador discusses all the issues in details, including Russian TV campaign against Armenia. The representative of the Committee to Protect Freedom of Expression proposes to remove Russian channel broadcasting to cable network domain. Ex-deputy Gurgen Eghiazaryan says the Russian programs are not occasional “This is the mirror reflection of our foreign policy.” RPA deputy Shirak Torosyan taking into consideration the withdrawal from Eurasian Economic Union says “Russian Parliament is not discussing anti-Armenian drafts.” The director of Centre for European Studies Artur Ghazinyan considers it weird that Russian Minister of Foreign Affairs reacts to the agreement between Armenia and EU “There is an EEU authorized body and it should declare that the agreement with EU doesn’t contradict EEU membership requirements.

There is also a discussion about conflict settlement requirements in Eastern Partnership declaration.

Discussions about law on “Domestic violence” are also in agenda, in this context, so called European values have also been criticized. Deputy of “Tsarukyan” alliance Gevorg Petrosyan gives such a description “This is a law about homicide.” He is against the idea to import European values into our society and spoil our morals.

The newspaper possesses a website, which has an “International” section. The section contains worldwide event news, including our monitoring topics, as well. European values are highlighted in cultural references and there are even remarks about any Armenian singer, dancer or another artist who promotes career success in the European cultural life. The website of the newspaper also contains videos about newspaper policy and adopted principles.

## ***6.2. “Hraparak” daily***

The newspaper is published 5 days in a week (except for Sunday and Monday). In September and October there are no analyses, interviews or news concerning monitoring topics. There are only two analyses about West, two interviews about European values and two news about West in a month.

There is no news concerning monitoring topics in October and November. There are 6 analyses about non-governmental organizations, 2 analyses about West and 4 analyses about European values in a month.

Articles on non-governmental organizations mainly contain criticism, for instance, one public organization has prevented a diaspora Armenian from aiding a local poor family. In the edition of October 20, the chief editor has written an extensive analysis “Civil society against society,” where the author criticizes initiatives, public figures and activists.” Citations; “So called public figures, who are continuously declaring about freedom of speech, implementation of mass media, removal of slavery from the nation, creation of healthy critical atmosphere, can’t be distinguished from those robber officials, who hate “Hraparak” and their critics,” or “there can be plenty of other patterns concerning non-governmental organizations, different individuals and units funded by international institutions, how they idle money given for the purpose of implementing mass media, how they come together with government and become a part of “the system”, how they act as a fake “opposition” and prevent real non-governmental organizations from acting properly. But this is actually enough to imagine that mass media doesn’t have partners in its daily work and has to take an excessive burden to support the public, to lead in fighting, to illuminate and raise sometimes, to be a supporter and to protect.”

There are 3 analyses about West and 6 analyses about European values referring to the monitoring topics in November and December. There are 6 interviews about the relations between RA and EU.

All the news of the newspaper portrays the Armenian reality. There is no international section. European events are remarked exclusively in the topics related to Armenia, for instance Eastern Partnership, Armenia-EU relations and so on.

### ***6.3. “Hayoc Ashxarh” daily***

The newspaper is published 5 days in a week (except for Sunday and Monday). In September and October there are no articles about the Ukraine or Syria concerning monitoring topics. The working style is very similar to daily “Iravunq”, both of them mention that European and Western values are not beneficial for us. In a month they have published one negative analysis about West and 4 negative analyses about European values. Europe is unable to resist illegal behavior of immigrants, it has no power against terrorists, there are conflicts among EU members and so on. In a month the newspaper has published 12 official messages on the performance of European institutions.

According to the editorial, supporters of European values are engaged in anti-Russian psychosis and create anti-Russian environment through fake polls.

The director of “Analytical Centre on Globalization and Regional Cooperation” Stepan Grigoryan is mentioned in two articles. There are several extensive articles in two editions of the newspaper about non-governmental organizations that are loyal to Western values. They are labelled as grant consumers. In a month the newspaper has published four huge articles of RPA deputy Artashes Geghamyan against Europe, protecting interests of Russia and EEU. The same articles have also been published by “Iravunq” daily. Citation, “Those non-governmental organizations are pursuing an objective to spoil Armenian-Russian strategic cooperation. “Analytical Centre on Globalization and Regional Cooperation” (director Stepan Grigoryan), “Collaboration for Democracy” (director Stepan Danielyan), and “Article 3” club (director Gayane Abrahamyan) have a great contribution to this process.

In October and November there was 1 news about non-governmental organizations, one news about West, 7 analyses and 6 interviews concerning monitoring topics. There were no other articles concerning monitoring topics. If there is balance between interviews that is each article receives 3 negative and 2 positive feedbacks (Armenia is a bridge between EU and EEU), analyses are solely negative. Europe will not be able to resist the flow of immigrants, Turkey neglects EU, people cooperating with European institutions have idled grants, Europe is being demolished and the agreement between Armenia and European Union is troubling. The newspaper has published RPA deputy Artashes Geghamyan’s article against Europe, in favor of Russia. “Iravunq” daily has also published the same article.

In November and December the newspaper discusses non-governmental organizations’ activities through 3 extensive analyses and 7 interviews in its 5 editions. The target is “Soros Foundation.” “Nation-Army Perception” has published the interview of “Nation’s Voice” NGO founder Tsovinar Kostanyan with a heading “In the target of Soros.” It is stated in the interview that those organizations guide students’ protest against restricting the rights of young men to draft deferments. The same theme is discussed by the author of initiative “For the Sake of Sovereignty Restoration”, he says, “It is high time to stop the venture of “Soros” in Armenia.” The law on “Domestic Violence” is also observed in the same context. In one of analytical articles of the newspaper it is stated, “We think, it is time to evaluate the fact, that non-governmental organizations have been turned into subjects of political activity. In the further editions of the newspaper there are 6 analyses, 12 interviews and 15 items of news published with the same cohesion of logic.

#### ***6.4. “Iravunq” daily***

The newspaper is published 3 days in a week on Tuesday, Thursday, and Friday. In September and October there are no articles about Syrian crisis concerning monitoring topics.

The newspaper has published three news in a month about the facts that the Ukraine has Azerbaijani opinion, the Ukraine aspires NATO and so on. The working style is very similar to “Hayoc ashxarh” daily’s working style that is they claim that European, Western values are not beneficial for us.

In a month an article has been published about West, two analyses about European values and one interview, and all of them are negative, for instance, EU assistance to Armenia has preconditions, European freedom means freedom for drug addicts, etc. But in the articles concerning the relations between Europe and Turkey, Europe is represented in a positive perspective, for instance, it states that Europe is a power to restrain Turkey and so on. The activities of non-governmental organizations are not covered, and the non-governmental organizations that support European values are labeled to be order performers. The director of the public organization “Center of Rehabilitation and Assistance to the Victims of Destructive Cults” Alexander Amaryan claims in the September 30 edition of the newspaper that non-governmental organizations are used in every colorful revolution. Their main purpose is to fulfill those actions that foreign clients order, the ones who pay money. On the sake of money those non-governmental organizations conduct information and send abroad. Of course, nobody gets surprised with the fact, that Sakunts (the director of Helsinki Citizens’ Assembly Vanadzor Office) is definitely executing orders. Moreover, once he opened a center to train colorful revolution participants in Vanadzor, which has been funded by foreigners. The caricatures of such news illustrate the director of “Center of Rehabilitation and Assistance to the Victims of Destructive Cults” Alexander Amaryan and the director of “Helsinki Citizens’ Assembly Vanadzor Office” Arthur Sakunts.

In a month newspaper has published 4 articles of the RPA deputy Artashes Geghamyan against Europe, in favor of Russia. The same articles have been published by “Hayoc Ashxarh” daily. In October and November there were published 3 items of news about West, 20 negative analyses about European values, for example that agreement between Armenia and EU is not a good option because Armenia will lose its sovereignty or Europe spoils future generations. The most remarkable is that such an opinion expresses director of “Constitutional Right” party Hayk Babukhanyan elected as a deputy with the list of the ruling RPA.

There are four items of news about activities of non-governmental organizations. Newspaper has published deputy Artashes Geghamyan’s article against Europe, in support to Russia. Geghamyan is also a deputy elected from the list of ruling RPA. The same article has been published by “Hayoc Ashxarh” daily.

In November and December there has been published 5 news about West and 22 analyses about European values. The deputy Hayk Babukhanyan elected from the RPA list represents the agreement between RA and EU in a negative context. The newspaper boycotts “Soros” in 4 analyses and 10 interviews. Even the fact, that Vazgen Sargsyan’s (former Minister of Defense of

the RA, hero of Karabakh) brother Aram Sargsyan has supported students' struggle to restore the right of deferment, is qualified as "Betrayal in commander's family." "Way out" (opposition party of the NA of the RA), which initiated the process of withdrawal from EEU are labeled as witnesses of "Soros" in the Nation Assembly. The draft of law on "Domestic violence" is also discussed in the framework of European negative values. RPA deputy Alike Sargsyan considers it to be "Anti-domestic code." In ten editions of the newspaper there are series of interviews with deputies of RPA and "Tsarukyan" alliance. Those deputies are against the law on "Domestic violence."

The newspaper has also published RPA deputy Artashes Geghamyan's articles with a title "EEU is the guarantee of peace and development of the RA." The article was published in Brussels on the day of signing the agreement between the RA and EU. On the same day the same article was published by "Hayoc ashxarh" daily.

In two editions of the newspaper there are 2 analyses and 4 interviews about "Way out" block's initiative in the National Assembly to terminate membership of Armenia in the EEU. RPA deputy Hayk Babukhanyan states in his interview, "At the moment the RA withdraws from EEU, Azerbaijan will take our place. RPA deputy Mihram Hakobyan claims, "The arguments during discussion of a question on terminating EEU membership are easy to reject." During hearings of the issue in the National Assembly for the strictest criticism against Russia, political scientist Stepan Grigoryan is called "afflicted from Russia."

The director of "Integration and development" organization Aram Safaryan assures, "There will be no actions to weaken our country." In the same edition there has been published also RPA deputy Artashes Geghamyan's speech in the National Assembly concerning the withdrawal from EEU. He justifies the decision to join EEU membership as exceptionally right and important.

### ***6.5. "Irates" daily***

The newspaper is published 2 days in a week on Monday and Friday. During monitoring period of September and October there are no articles about the Ukrainian and Syrian crises. The newspaper has published an analysis about West and two analyses about European values. For example, they state that "Soros Foundation" destroys Armenian families, European freedom means independence to minorities and so on.

In October and November there are no articles about Syrian crisis concerning monitoring topics.

In a month there have been published 4 analyses about West, 4 analyses about European values and mainly negative interview stating that the future of Europe is vague and so on. In three

editions continuously the newspaper gives a page to Sergey Shakaryants and a page to Arthur Hovhannisyanyan who glorify EEU, covertly criticizing EU.

On the 9<sup>th</sup> of November the newspaper has published a priest's interview against European values. Citation: money bait is hidden behind the draft on "Prevention of domestic violence and protection of victims from domestic violence". We are suggested an amount of money to adopt the law, so we are birded to destroy our families later. Nowadays, several officials should fill their pockets with those millions so that tomorrow Armenians will lose their national identity and feature.

In November and December there have been published 2 analyses about West, 6 analyses about European values and 10 interviews. In five editions continuously the newspaper gives a page to author Sergey Shakaryants and a page to author Arthur Hovhannisyanyan who glorify EEU, covertly criticizing EU.

Sergey Shakaryants's analytical articles are called "Once again about Armenian false friends." It refers to the USA and European countries.

There is published also an analytical article titled "Armenia and... its adversary friends' mystery." The author is an Austrian-Armenian, who criticizes Armenian-Russian "friendship." EU agreement fills the gaps of EEU, claims ex-deputy Hovhannes Igityan and political scientist Alexander Markarov expressing their opinion that EU and EEU cooperation will balance each other.

There is another analytical analysis titled "Do not act as Georgia and the Ukraine." This is a concern about the agreement between the RA and EU.

In his interview political scientist Levon Shirinyan touches upon reflections of Russian mass media about the RA-EU agreement. "If Armenia is a traitor wife for Russia, therefore the husband is alcoholic and drug addicted," claims the latter.

The director of "Integration and development" public organization Aram Safaryan assumes in his interview, "Armenia is not leaving the Russian Federation." RPA ex-deputy Hamlet Hovhannisyanyan states that the program of "Zvezda" has been ordered and not intelligent part of the RF population always sets an issue to take revenge on Nzdeh.

Ashot Manucharyan claims in his interview, "Venice commission and EU destroy and demolish our values and deny our identity."

## ***6.6. www.vesti.am***

This is a bilingual website on Armenian and Russian. It is active approximately 10 hours a day, and uploads 40-43 articles from 10:00 up to 20:00. There are almost no reflections of NGO activities. Sometimes a reflection is made on a certain event organized by an NGO or the chairperson of an NGO gives an interview as a field expert. Articles about non-domestic events are in

“International” section. It has a separate section “Eurasia” to illuminate activities of Eurasian Economic Union.

In September and October there have been 9 news about Syrian crisis and nothing else interesting for our monitoring topics.

In October and November there have been published only some news concerning our monitoring topics, one news about non-governmental organizations, 6 news about West, 14 news about European values, 7 news about the Ukraine and 9 ones about Syria. All of them were event news. An Armenian businessman was murdered in the Ukraine, the Russian language is denied in schools, etc. 92 percent of Syrian territory is liberated.

Expert Gevorg Melikyan’s opinion about Armenia-EU agreement has been presented. Citation: “The document was analyzed by Russian and EEU experts in details. It means they accepted all the points. The document has been agreed according to EEU rules.”

In November and December there have been published only several news concerning our monitoring topics. 3 news about non-governmental organizations, 9 news about West, 24 news about European values, 14 news about the Ukraine and 11 ones about Syria. All of them were event news. The agreement of RA and EU has been represented in a positive context.

### ***6.7. www.nt.am***

The website is in 4 languages (Armenian, English, French, Russian). It is active approximately 10 hours a day and uploads 50-55 articles from 10:00 up to 20:00. There are almost no reflections of NGO activities. Sometimes a reflection is made on a certain event organized by an NGO or the chairperson of an NGO gives an interview as a field expert. Articles about non-domestic events are in the section “World”.

In September and October there were 2 analyses about West, in the analyses the same author is strictly against West and the idea to expand their values in Armenia. There is no news about other monitoring topics.

In October and November there was one analysis about European values, another one about the Ukraine and 2 others about Syria. The rest of the news is to illustrate events or copies from other media, for example, 30 news about non-governmental organizations, 4 news about West, 3 news about European values, 14 news about the Ukraine and 21 ones about Syria. There are discussions also about Armenia-EU agreement, activities of non-governmental organizations in such spheres as environment protection, domestic violence, quality and safety of imported toys, judicial protection of an individual.

In November and December there were 3 analyses about European values, 1 analysis about the Ukraine and another one about Syria. The rest of the news are to illustrate events or copies from other media, for example, 40 news about non-governmental organizations, 10 news about West, 25 news about European values, 18 news about the Ukraine and 25 ones about Syria.

There were published 10 interviews about Russian media reflection of Armenia-EU agreement. In his interview political scientist Levon Shirinyan reminds about European roots of the Republic of Armenia. Generally, the entire interview contains positive feedbacks about Armenia-EU agreement.

### ***6.8. www.armeniasputnik.am***

This is a bilingual website on Armenian and Russian. It is active approximately 16 hours a day and uploads 45-50 articles. There are almost no reflections of NGO activities. Sometimes a reflection is made on a certain event organized by an NGO or the chairperson of an NGO gives an interview as a field expert. It illustrates events only about neighbor countries and Russia.

In September and October there was only one analysis about Syrian crisis and another one about European values concerning monitoring topics.

In October and November there was one analysis about European values, 4 analyses about Syrian crisis and all of them protect Russian interests, for example, Polish Foreign Minister Witold Waszczykowski protects “Eastern cooperation” and Poland tries to regenerate this program as it has been ordered from another side of the ocean. Poland actively participates in international affairs, trying to prevent exploitation of “Northern stream-2” and “Western stream” in the Black sea (by Turkey). The analyses also include opinions that “Soros Foundation” supports the process of adoption of the new criminal code in Armenia, which will protect rights of LGBT community to hold gay-parades and implement unisex marriage. The coordinator of “For the Sake of Sovereignty Restoration” Hayk Nahapetyan has the same conviction about this issue.

The rest of news is about the fact that Armenia is the third country accepting so many refugees from Syria or Armenian citizens have been arrested in the Ukraine.

In November and December there were 3 analyses about European values, 3 analyses about Syrian crisis and all contain positive feedbacks about Russia.

In his analysis Arman Vaneskeghyan observes negative sides of EU-Armenia agreement. Citation: “The agreement will not determine Armenian society to have Russian or European orientation. Actually inconveniences and imperfections of the agreement have not been changed until the last

minute. Even at the time when it became clear that EU agreement can perfectly fill Armenian foreign policy doctrine, which is based on multilateral principles.”

In Arman Boshyan’s interview he states that EU-Armenia agreement aims to weaken the borders of Armenia. Citation: “It is often mentioned, that preparing EU-Armenia agreement Russian interests also have been taken into consideration. Maybe interests of Russia have been taken into consideration but not interests of Armenia. Geopolitically EU is already a failed project. It is decayed physically and conceptually. This is another step to consolidate its positions.” Ex-deputy Azat Arshakyan says EU agreement will not give any profit to Armenia.

After signing the agreement there were published several news about official standpoints and interviews with Russian political scientists, who insist that agreement with EU will not prevent Armenian-Russian relations in the confines of EEU. One discussion taken place in Tbilisi was illuminated. The participants indicate “Armenia served as a sample for all countries that want to cooperate with Brussels, but don’t want to enter to the “European family.”

Comparing agreement between the Ukraine and EU analyst Ruben Gyulmisaryan states, that the agreement signed with Armenia is not different from the one signed with the Ukraine four years ago and writes, “A question arises, if it worth to organize “Maidan” in the Ukraine, destroy the powerful economics, create a range of internal and external political issues, if the same result can be reached absolutely in a calm way, without any radical movements. But this question is directed to the ones, who organized the movement to benefit from the fact that the country fights against itself.”

### ***6.9. www.tert.am***

This website is published in 3 languages (Armenian, English, Russian). It runs 24 hours a day and publishes approximately 200 news. The activities of non-governmental organizations are hardly covered. Sometimes it is published an event organized by any public organization or a director of a public organization gives an interview as a field expert.

In September and October the newspaper has published 20 event news about Syrian crisis, 10 event news about the Ukrainian crisis and 60 event news about West and European values. It writes everything about West and Europe, for example, sports events, criminal mosaics, in Sweden a mosque has been burnt, Paris has been visited by a lot of tourists, Catalonia referendum and so on.

In October and November the newspaper has published 3 news about non-governmental organizations (non-governmental organizations about local elections in November 5), 30 news

about European values, 11 news about the Ukraine and 20 news about Syria concerning monitoring topics.

It writes everything about West and Europe, sports events, criminal mosaics, intensity among Turkey-Europe relations, Barcelona wastes 83 percent of the budget on football players' salaries, photos of the UK royal family members and their pets, Ronaldo has paid for medical care of 370 victims of fires in Portugal and Spain, in the Ukraine son of Arsen Avakon minister of Internal Affairs has been arrested and so on.

In November and December there have been published 6 news about non-governmental organizations, 80 news about European values, 22 news about the Ukraine and 25 news about Syria. It writes everything about West and Europe, including sports events and criminal mosaics. 50 interviews represent the advantages of RA-EU agreement. There are only 5 interviews the participants of which consider the assignment of EU agreement negative for Armenia.

#### ***6.10. www.regnum.ru***

This is a monolingual Russian website. It has correspondent center in Armenia. The website runs 24 hours a day and publishes approximately 1000 news. Sometimes it publishes an event organized by any public organization or a director of a public organization gives an interview as a field expert.

In September and October the website has published 30 analyses about Syrian crisis and 40 analyses about the Ukrainian crisis concerning monitoring topics. During monitoring the website has published more than 400 analyses. The analyses about the Ukraine are 10 percent of the whole. These analyses are without exception the criticism of the Ukrainian authorities, for example the Ukraine cannot repay loans received from international organizations, in the country some citizens are dissatisfied with the authorities, and so on.

In October and November there has been 1 news about European values, 64 news about the Ukraine (included Ukrainian mass reviews) and 10 news about Syria. Very often a single analysis discusses about both Syrian and Ukrainian crises. The reviews of the Ukrainian mass media contain only critical materials, for example deputies are against the president's draft to be deprived from immunity, payment for medical care, possible gas price increase means genocide and destruction of the county, the Ukraine respects the soldiers of Nazi Germany and ignores the Poles, Nazis against Christians, the Ukraine is in bloody chaos and the USA and EU are guilty for it, the Ukraine uses only 7 percent of its potential to reach the cosmos, Ukraine's real estate market will explode, the Ukraine intends to fight against Russia and so on.

The analyses about Europe are absolutely for the benefit of Russian interests. Putin has managed to remove important regions of the planet from the USA, USA- EU contradictions are deepening, and the end of unipolar world, the USA makes Poland act against Russia and so on.

Armenia-EU agreement is being criticized. In the interview given to “RIA Novosti” the president of the RA Serj Sargsyan states that discussions on the closure of the Metsamor Nuclear Power Plant are initiated artificially and have nothing to do with the reality, in the agreement there is no point about the closure. Two years later political scientist Andrey Areshev writes that the Nuclear Power plant will be closed. Europe is criticized every day, for example, Europe is guided by dual standards and so on.

There are lots of event news; 22 news about non-governmental organizations, 281 about West, 285 about European values, 550 about the Ukraine and 650 about Syria. The articles about the Ukraine contain only criticism. The Ukrainian miners strike, the president’s security measures have been strengthened and so on.

In November and December there were 6 analyses concerning monitoring topics and 22 articles about RA-EU agreement. There are doubts that the agreement will be applied or will have positive feedback after its implementation. The statement of the Chairman of the Board of the Eurasian Economic Commission Tigran Sargsyan has been published, according to which EU changes its attitude towards EEU. Articles with the Ukrainian topics prevail, they are 86, including the Ukrainian mass media reviews and 20 news about Syria. Very often a single analysis discusses about both Syrian and the Ukrainian crises. The reviews of the Ukrainian mass media contain only critical materials. Topics about the Ukraine mainly discuss the activities of ex-president of Georgia Mikhail Saakashvili. It carries out the line that he has been supported by the USA and EU, predicting that resolution in the Ukraine’s is near.

### **Brief Information on ACGRC**

Analytical Centre on Globalization and Regional Cooperation (ACGRC) was established in 2002. ACGRC with its partners are implementing projects on strengthening democracy and human rights in Armenia, combating disinformation and propaganda, conflict resolution and trust building (projects on Armenia-Turkey dialogue, Armenia-Azerbaijan dialogue and trilateral Armenia-Azerbaijan-Turkey) as well as on protection of minority rights. ACGRC is a full member and founder of several European networks such Eastern Partnership Minorities Network (London, Budapest), Visa-Free Europe Coalition (Warsaw) and Policy Association for an Open Society (Prague). ACGRC won the Black Sea NGO Award for promotion of regional cooperation in the Wider Black Sea Region (the Award is given by the European Commission, GMF and Romanian Foreign Ministry).

Our web-page: [www.acgrc.am](http://www.acgrc.am)

Our Facebook page: <https://www.facebook.com/ACGRC/>

30.05.2018